

Summary report on the institutional accreditation procedure of Luxembourg School of Business (LSB) and the programme accreditation procedure of the “Master in Management” (MM) programme at Luxembourg School of Business (LSB)

AQ Austria was commissioned by the Ministry of Higher Education and Research of Luxembourg (MESR) to conduct the institutional accreditation procedure as well as the programme accreditation procedure of the masters programme “Master in Management” (MM) planned by the Luxembourg School of Business (LSB).

The assessment was performed in accordance with the “guide for applicants and quality assurance agencies” for the “accreditation of foreign higher education institutions and programmes in the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg” (of October 2016) referring to the provisions of articles 28, 28bis and 28ter of the amended law of 19 June 2009 on the organisation of higher education. The areas and quality criteria applied are listed in article 4 of the grand ducal regulation of 24 August 2016 on the accreditation of foreign higher education institutions and programmes in the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg.

1 Short information on the accreditation application

Information on the applicant institution	
Applicant institution	Luxembourg School of Business (LSB)
Legal status	A.s.b.l Association sans but lucratif
Initial accreditation	2017
Site	Luxembourg
Number of students	2019: 28 MBA students
Accredited degree programmes	Weekend MBA (WMBA)
Information on the degree programme to be established	
Name of degree programme	Master in Management (MM)
Type of degree programme	masters programme

ECTS	120 ECTS minimum for graduation
Academic degree	Master in Management
Accredited for the following location(s)	Luxembourg

2 Short information on the accreditation procedures

The assessment was based on the accreditation application submitted by the LSB and a 2-day site visit. The site visit took place according to a schedule previously defined by AQ Austria. The members of the expert panel were:

Name	Function and institution	Role within the review panel
Jörg Wendel	Head of Department Operations & Services ZHAW School of Management and Law	expert quality assurance in higher education and chairing member
Dr. Evelyn Ehrenberger	President HDBW Munich	expert with scientific qualification and experience in HEI-leadership
Univ. Prof. Dr. Alexander Mohr	Director of the MSc programme "Export and Internationalization Management" Institute for Export Management Vienna University of Economics and Business	expert with scientific qualification and experience in programme management
Univ.-Prof. Dr.phil. Armin Kreuzthaler	Professor Karl-Franzens- Universität Graz (University of Graz) Center for Entrepreneurship and Applied Business Studies Former Director PD & T Magna International	expert with scientific qualification and pertinent professional qualification
Moritz Dragosits, BSc	Student (Master) Economics Vienna University of Economics and Business	student expert

On April 2nd and 3rd 2019, the expert panel and the representatives of AQ Austria attended a site visit at the premises of LSB in Luxembourg.

3 Profile of Luxembourg School of Business (LSB)

As stated in LSB's self-evaluation report, LSB was founded in 2014 and started with the first generation of Weekend MBA (WMBA) students in 2015. LSB was established by Marin Njavro, current managing director of the institution with the help of Dr. John Branch, founding Dean of LSB and currently a professor of Marketing at LSB and at Ross School of Business, University of Michigan.

In 2017, Luxembourg School of Business received the conditional accreditation by the Ministry of Higher Education and Research (MESR).

4 Description of the study programme "Master in Management" (MM)

According to LSB's self-evaluation report, the "Master in Management" (MM) programme at LSB is to be considered as a general management studies programme, predominantly targeting students who hold a non-business bachelor degree and often have no professional experience. This intensive full-time programme will offer an action-based curriculum designed to help candidates of various backgrounds to understand key business concepts and integrate into the job market easily.

The MM programme aims to provide graduates with practical skills, knowledge and experiences as well as competencies related to employment that will help them succeed in a global business environment and provide value for the firms in which they will work.

5 Summary of assessment results

The following summary originates from the final review report transmitted to the MESR on 24.07.2019.

The expert panel perceived LSB as ambitious and extremely target-oriented. The HEI is consistently managed in an entrepreneurial manner, which the experts see as an advantage for achieving the strategic goals set.

This is apparent, for example, by short decision-making chains. This current structure of governance seems appropriate in LSB's the present "start-up" phase. However, with increasing size and a higher degree of organisational maturity, LSB is recommended to review the organizational structure. In addition, it is recommended that LSB fosters the involvement of the various stakeholders and in particular the regional economy more closely into LSB's governance. This should not be difficult for LSB to implement, as the interviewed alumni of the WMBA, among others, represent an access to the Luxembourg economy. LSB is already well-connected with other international HEIs and benefits strongly from that network, especially from its links to the ZSEM. Thereby LSB shows itself to be willing and able to learn from the knowledge and requirements of its partners.

LSB has shown a large number of quality-oriented processes and tools. In particular areas, e.g. Assurance of Learning (AoL), LSB is exceptionally well prepared for a young organisation. This is in line with LSB's strategic orientation, but also results from its close ties to ZSEM. However, an integrative QMS in which all existing and future mechanisms are systematically documented is still missing.

The experts consider the greatest challenge for LSB to lie in setting up its faculty, especially with regard to in-house lecturers. This particularly results from the fact that the qualification requirements for all employees are expected to be high. At the same time, LSB as a private HEI faces the challenge of financing itself out of its own resources. The expert panel therefore understands, why LSB is cautious in its recruitment and decided to pool certain functions in a small group of individuals. LSB has managed to position itself in the Luxembourg education market. It can be assumed that national accreditation will strengthen this position. This should give LSB the financial capacity to accelerate the implementation of its strategic goals.

Based on the evaluation of the relevant criteria the experts recommend the institutional accreditation of LSB, albeit with a number of conditions.

The expert panel assessed the MM programme that aims to attract mainly local, but also international students. The full-time study programme fits into the strategic focus of LSB and into the existing educational portfolio in the area of general management (e.g. WMBA).

The contents and competence goals of the curriculum correspond to the basic requirements of a management degree at master's level. However, the option of completing an internship instead of a master's thesis as well as the length of the programme were strongly questioned by the expert panel. The MM programme has been designed to provide a mix of theoretical foundations and practical elements that meet the needs of business. The expert panel was able to get an idea of the need for a general management education in Luxembourg. It remains to be seen to what extent the market will accept the planned masters programme. Regardless, the expert panel felt that the projected development of student numbers was overly ambitious.

The planned blocked structure is suitable for the planned competence development. On the other hand, the planned workload in the full-time study programme is too high and cannot be studied. The workload must therefore be adjusted before the MM programme starts.

The [...] links of LSB with highly ranked universities around the world enable LSB to employ reputable guest lecturers. With regard to the academic positioning of the MM programme, the experts believe that LSB still lacks permanent lecturers (so-called "core faculty") who are able to promote the academic competencies of LSB externally and internally and to take responsibility for the content of the MM programme.

Finally, it must also be noted in this context that the requirement of at least 15 full-time staff equivalents of teaching and research staff as stated by Luxembourg law is not yet being met.

In conclusion, the expert panel considers that the MM programme is in line with most of the Luxembourgish criteria for programme assessment.

Therefore, the panel recommends the Master in Management (MM) Programme to be accredited with conditions.

Areas of consideration	Assessment
<i>1 Organisation, strategy and sustainability of the higher education institution</i>	1a met
	1b met
	1c met

	<p>1d met 1e partially met 1f met 1g met 1h met</p> <p>Over all partially met with one condition</p>
<p><i>2 Aims and objectives of the academic programme</i></p>	<p>2a met 2b partially met 2c met 2d not met 2e met</p> <p>Over all partially met with three conditions</p>
<p><i>3 Admission, evaluation, certification</i></p>	<p>3a met 3b met 3c met 3d met</p> <p>Over all met</p>
<p><i>4 Implementation of the academic programme</i></p>	<p>4a partially met 4b partially met 4c partially met 4d met 4e met</p> <p>Over all partially met with four conditions</p>
<p><i>5 Research</i></p>	<p>5a partially met 5b met</p> <p>Over all partially met with two conditions</p>
<p><i>6 Quality assurance measures</i></p>	<p>6a met 6b partially met 6c met 6d met</p>

	6e met
	6f met
	Over all partially met with one condition

6 Recommendation to the Ministry of Higher Education and Research of Luxembourg (MESR)

The expert panel recommends to the Ministry of Higher Education and Research of Luxembourg (MESR) to accredit the LSB and the MM programme with the conditions proposed below:

- **Condition 1:** The institution has to ensure and demonstrate that the 15 full-time equivalent employees, as required by the regulation of the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg, are in place within one year after the decision on accreditation by the Ministry of Higher Education and Research (MESR).
- **Condition 2:** Based on the definition that one ECTS credit corresponds to 30 hours of student workload, LSB has to demonstrate how they calculated the workload (amount of hours) for each module. They also have to describe the amount of hours spent on the different activities (face-to-face learning, group work, reading assignments, writing assignments, execution of a survey, preparing for an exam, etc.)
- **Condition 3:** In order to ensure that the internship corresponds to level 7 of the Luxembourg qualifications framework (CLQ), the internship admission criteria, the character of the internship, its learning outcomes and goals as well as requirements for the internship report have to be defined.
- **Condition 4:** The timeline for the whole programme has to be extended to 24 months, the time frame for the master's thesis and the internship has to be extended to 6 months to be in line with European conventions and standards. The adapted curriculum must be submitted before the MM programme starts for the first time.
- **Condition 5:** LSB monitors the number of students starting the MM programme continuously and compares it yearly to the targets specified in the financial plan. If necessary, the LSB adjusts its financial plan accordingly.
 LSB has to provide a documentation on the evolution of the number of students, differentiating between the students who are already admitted and the students who are currently applying. Furthermore, it shows in the documentation how this has so far influenced the financial plan. In order to guarantee, that LSB adjusts its financial plan yearly, LSB also describes in the concept for the QMS how this process is supported.
- **Condition 6:** LSB has to provide a project plan that shows how teaching space will be adapted in accordance with the planned admission figures by Q2/2020 latest.
- **Condition 7:** All core courses are led (not only assisted) by staff permanently employed by LSB. Leading teachers have to be employed to an extent of at least 50%.
 LSB has to provide working contracts for the leading teachers of the core courses of the MM programme by Q2 / 2020 latest.
- **Condition 8:** In conjunction with condition 7, LSB proves to employ lead teachers for all core subjects before the start of the first cycle of the MM programme.
- **Condition 9:** LSB shows how it intends to increase the number of publications authored or co-authored by its permanent staff.



- **Condition 10:** LSB keeps records of all research activities conducted by its employees over a year and submits this documentation.
- **Condition 11:** Within one year from the MESR's decision, the LSB submits a concept for an overall quality assurance system, including a policy for quality assurance and publishes it on its homepage. This concept describes the interdependencies of the various quality assurance instruments in place (direct and indirect measurements, internal and external reviews, etc.) and how often they are to be applied. Furthermore, it must be shown how the knowledge gained is integrated into the strategic decision-making processes of LSB's management. At this stage, it is not necessary to describe all processes according to process management standards, but their inputs and outputs have to be specified.

Furthermore, the expert panel makes the following recommendations:

- **Recommendation 1:** The expert panel strongly recommends that LSB further invests in the recruitment and development of local faculty as well as in the systematic integration of business partners.
- **Recommendation 2:** The institutionalisation of the strategic plan should be advanced. LSB should actively involve all stakeholders (students, lecturers, administrative staff, boards, etc.) in the further development and implementation of the strategic plan (see "Concerning pillar 3").
- **Recommendation 3:** It is recommended to monitor the performance of the financial plan for the institution on a regular basis.
- **Recommendation 4:** The recruitment procedures should be systematically integrated into the development of LSB's quality management system.
- **Recommendation 5:** The experts strongly recommend strengthening national and regional partnerships (see also 1a). This applies above all to partnerships outside the corporate world. Furthermore, it is recommended to actively involve local and international stakeholders in the process designing programmes, e.g. in the definition of the competencies to be achieved.
- **Recommendation 6:** The expert panel recommends to continue developing the existing partnerships in more detail, specifically regarding research activities and exchange programmes.
- **Recommendation 7:** LSB is recommended to intensify its efforts in the area of international exchange programmes and to apply for the Erasmus+ Charter as soon as possible. At the same time, the expert panel recommends to build up the necessary administrative structures and procedures for the operational implementation of the exchange programmes
- **Recommendation 8:** LSB is recommended to combine linked topics into clusters of subjects and define learning goals on the level of clusters like "Finance", "Marketing", "Leadership and Strategy" etc. This would not affect the current module structure.
- **Recommendation 9:** LSB is recommended to provide students with recommendations concerning which elective courses should be selected in order to achieve the learning goals of clusters or for the whole programme.
- **Recommendation 10:** LSB is recommended to set up an accompanying evaluation of the effectiveness of the curriculum, as it was newly designed.
- **Recommendation 11:** After two cohorts have gone through the internship, LSB should carry out a review in order to assess and ensure that the learning outcomes achieved by the students correspond to level 7 of the CLQ.
- **Recommendation 12:** The expert panel recommends adapting the terminology regarding modules and courses. The term "courses" should be changed to "modules". The term "modules" should be used for lectures.
- **Recommendation 13:** The panel recommends that modules run over a longer period of time, for instance 8 or 9 weeks instead of 7 weeks given the rather high number of weekly study hours that 7-week teaching modules imply.
- **Recommendation 14:** The panel also recommends updating and correcting the differences in workload between the syllabi and the different workload calculation sheets.
- **Recommendation 15:** It should be a target that the proportion of permanent teachers (i.e. employed at LSB) and external speakers follows the proposed ratio of theoretical and practical subjects.
- **Recommendation 16:** The tutoring programme should be formally defined ahead of the start of the first cycle. A mentoring programme should be formalised before the first internships / master thesis start.
- **Recommendation 17:** Research at LSB should be systemically developed in the future.

- **Recommendation 18:** The experts strongly recommend formalising the process of collecting, analysing and using data in case of increasing numbers of students and staff.
- **Recommendation 19:** The role of the Board of Administrators, which is responsible for strategic, fiduciary and monitoring issues and thus is undoubtedly the most important body of the LSB, should be made more transparent on the homepage.
- **Recommendation 20:** With increasing growth, the separation of functions and thus of powers should be ensured.
- **Recommendation 21:** LSB should intensify the participation of all stakeholders, especially in everyday work. Furthermore, it is desirable to provide students with more information about their possibilities of participation and to seek their active involvement.
- **Recommendation 22:** The panel recommends to intensify the work of the Equal Opportunities Committee and to seek a more heterogeneous composition of the different committees of LSB to give more weight to this issue.

7 Accreditation decisions

The Ministry of Higher Education and Research of Luxembourg (MESR) issued the Ministerial Decree of 30 July 2019 on the accreditation of the study programme "Master in Management" offered by the specialised higher education institution "Luxembourg School of Business" (LSB).

The statements on the following pages originate from a courtesy translation of the aforementioned Ministerial Decree from French to English.

This Ministerial Decree states that the institution "Luxembourg School of Business" (LSB) is accredited as a specialised higher education institution for the period from 15 September 2019 to 14 September 2024 to offer the study programme "Master in Management".

The above-mentioned study programme is accredited for the period from 15 September 2019 to 14 September 2024.

The accreditation of the study programme leading to the "Master in Management" is subject to the minimum requirement that access to the study programme is reserved to candidates holding a Bachelor's degree of at least 180 ECTS credits or a diploma registered in the register of academic qualifications as provided by article 68 of the law of 28 October 2016 on the recognition of professional qualifications and corresponding to level 6 of the Luxembourg Qualifications Framework pursuant to article 69 of the aforementioned law. Additional admission requirements may be set out by the specialised higher education institution "Luxembourg School of Business".

The accreditation of the institution "Luxembourg School of Business" as a specialised higher education institution for the study programme leading to the „Master in Management“ is subject, for the present Decree to be valid, to the following conditions, whose fulfilment must be proven with supporting documents until 15 September 2020 at the latest:

- The specialised higher education institution „Luxembourg School of Business“ must review and adapt the curriculum of the study programme leading to the „Master in Management“ according to the following elements:

- a) The total duration of the programme must be extended to 24 months and the time provided for the preparation of the Master's thesis or for the internship in a company must be extended to 6 months.
 - b) The specialised higher education institution "Luxembourg School of Business" must specify the system applied to determine the workload of each module (in number of hours) and thereby applied to determine the number of ECTS credits allocated to each module, it being understood that one ECTS credit corresponds to 25 to 30 hours of work. It must each time detail the number of hours allocated to the various learning activities, such as courses, group work, reading assignments, writing assignments, exam preparation.
 - c) The specialised higher education institution "Luxembourg School of Business" must prove that the internship included in the study programme leading to the "Master in Management" corresponds to the descriptors of level 7 of the Luxembourg Qualifications Framework as defined in Appendix A of the grand ducal regulation of 17 February 2017 on the recognition of professional qualifications. For this purpose, it must precisely define the admission criteria, the type of internship, the learning outcomes and goals as well as the modalities and criteria for the preparation and the assessment of the internship report.
- In accordance with article 28ter, paragraph 2 of the amended law of 19 June 2009 on the organisation of higher education, the specialised higher education institution "Luxembourg School of Business" must prove that its staff consists on a permanent basis of at least 15 employees (in full-time equivalent) holding an academic qualification at least at Master's level and conducting documented activities of teaching and research within and in the name of the specialised higher education institution.
 - The specialised higher education institution "Luxembourg School of Business" must prove that all the core courses of the study programme leading to the "Master in Management" are taught by leading teachers who are permanent employees of this institution with a degree of occupation of at least 50% of a full-time position.
 - The specialised higher education institution "Luxembourg School of Business" must draw up a research strategy and demonstrate the relevance of its research activities in relation with the study programme leading to the "Master in Management". It must provide a detailed record of research activities performed until 15 September 2020 by each permanent academic staff member as well as of the research activities planned for the academic year 2020-2021 on behalf of the "Luxembourg School of Business". In addition, it must provide information on how it intends to increase the number of publications of its permanent academic staff.
 - The specialised higher education institution "Luxembourg School of Business" must draw up a quality assurance system and publish the related policy on its website. The newly developed concept must describe the interdependence of the various existing quality assurance tools and their frequency of application. It must also show how the newly gained knowledge and experience are integrated into the strategic decision-making processes.
 - The specialised higher education institution "Luxembourg School of Business" must prove that its facilities are adapted to the number of students planned for the academic year 2020-2021 and that they comply with current safety standards. To this end, the institution must provide a detailed record of the available classrooms, specifying for each room the number of available seats, the occupancy level and the weekly planning

of their use and provide supporting documents regarding their compliance with applicable safety standards.

- The specialised higher education institution „Luxembourg School of Business“ must provide information on the number of students expected in the study programme leading to the „Master in Management“ for the academic year 2020-2021 and submit forecasts on the evolution of the number of students for the period 2020-2021 to 2024-2025. At the same time, it must submit a financing plan covering that same period and describe the recommended adjustment mechanisms to respond to a development of the number of students.
- The specialised higher education institution „Luxembourg School of Business“ must submit a plan for the implementation of the recommendations made by the „Agentur für Qualitätssicherung und Akkreditierung Austria“ as summarized on pages 36 and 37¹ of its assessment report.

¹ The corresponding page numbers were corrected to 38 and 39 in the following Ministerial Decree: Arrêté ministériel du 2 octobre 2019 modifiant l'arrêté ministériel du 30 juillet 2019 portant accréditation du programme d'études "Master in Management" offert par l'établissement d'enseignement supérieur spécialisé "Luxembourg School of Business" (LSB)