



Agentur für
Qualitätssicherung
und Akkreditierung
Austria

Review Report of the Expert Panel to the accreditation of Central European University Private University (CEU PU)

Accreditation of Central European University as Austrian private university
and the following degree programmes:

Bachelor of Arts in "Culture, Politics and Society" (CPS)

Bachelor of Arts in "Philosophy, Politics and Economics" (PPE)

Master of Arts in "International Public Affairs" (IPA)

Erasmus Mundus Master of Arts in "Public Policy" (Mundus MAPP)

Master of Arts in "Women's and Gender Studies" (GEMMA)

Master of Science in "Environmental Sciences, Policy and Management"
(MESPOM)

pursuant to section 7 of the Decree on Accreditation of Private Universities (PU-AkkVO)

Vienna, 18.06.2019

Table of Contents

1 Principles for the procedure	4
2 Short information on the accreditation application for the modification of the administrative decision on accreditation of study programme	5
3 Explanatory notes of the experts	8
4 Statements and assessments based on the assessment criteria pursuant to PU-AkkVO	11
4.1 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (1): Objectives and profile development	11
4.2 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (2): Development plan	11
4.3 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (3): Degree programmes and teaching	13
4.4 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 17 (1) a-n: Degree programme and degree programme management – Bachelor of Arts in "Culture, Politics and Society" (CPS).....	16
4.5 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 17 (1) a-n: Degree programme and degree programme management – Bachelor of Arts in "Philosophy, Politics and Economics" (PPE) ..	22
4.6 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 17 (1) a-n: Degree programme and degree programme management – Master of Arts in "International Public Affairs" (IPA)	27
4.7 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 17 (1) a-p: Degree programme and degree programme management – Erasmus Mundus Master of Arts in "Public Policy" (Mundus MAPP)	34
4.8 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (4): Research and development / advancement and appreciation of the arts	41
4.9 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (5): Organisation of the private university and its services	44
4.10 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (6): Funding and resources.....	51
4.11 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (7): National and international co-operation ..	53
4.12 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (8): Quality management system	55
4.13 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (9): Information.....	57
5 Summary and final assessment	59
6 Reviewed documents.....	59
7 Confirmation of the experts	60
8 Annex 1: review report to GEMMA	61
8.1 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 17 (1) a-p: Degree programme and degree programme management – Master of Arts in "Women's and Gender Studies" (GEMMA) ..	62
8.2 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 Abs 5: Organisation of the private university and its services	70
8.3 Summary and final assessment.....	72
8.4 Documents reviewed	73
8.5 Confirmation of the expert	74
9 Annex 2: review report to MESPOM.....	75
9.1 Preliminary remarks by the experts	75

9.2 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 17 (1) a-p: Degree programme and degree programme management – Erasmus Mundus Master of Arts in “Public Policy” (Mundus MAPP)	75
9.3 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 Abs 5: Organisation of the private university and its services	81
9.4 Summary and final assessment	82
9.5 Documents reviewed	82
9.6 Confirmation of the expert	84

1 Principles for the procedure

Higher education in Austria

The Austrian higher education system currently comprises:

- 22 public universities (including the Danube University Krems, a state university for postgraduate further education);
- 14 private universities, the providers of which are private entities, which have been publicly recognised through accreditation
- 21 universities of applied sciences; the providers are either institutions organised under private law or public entities, which are subsidised by the state and accredited;
- the university colleges of teacher education are provided by the state or private institutions that have been publicly recognised through accreditation;
- the philosophic-theologic higher education institutions are provided by the Catholic Church;
- the tasks of the Institute of Science and Technology – Austria is the appreciation and advancement of new fields of research as well as the post-graduate education in the form of PhD and post-doc programmes.

In the academic year 2018/2019¹, almost 294,000 students studied at the 22 universities. Around 59,000 students studied at the 21 accredited universities of applied sciences. In the same year, 14 accredited private universities recorded around 14,400 students.

External quality assurance

Pursuant to the Act on Quality Assurance in Higher Education (HS-QSG), public universities must have their internal quality management system certified in the framework of an audit procedure every seven years. There are no legal or financial consequences linked to the certification decision.

Private universities must undergo an AQ Austria-coordinated institutional accreditation procedure every six years. After twelve years of uninterrupted accreditation, the accreditation can be awarded for twelve years at a time. If in the meantime degree programmes or certificate university programmes leading to an academic degree are set up, they also require accreditation.

Universities of applied sciences must have their initial institutional accreditation renewed after six years. After that, they switch to the audit system. The accreditation status is, however, linked to a positive certification decision following the audit procedure. Initial accreditation is required for each degree programme before it may be offered.

¹ As of May 2019

Accreditation of private universities and their degree programmes

In Austria, private universities wanting to operate as higher education institutions require institutional accreditation, which has to be renewed on a regular basis. In addition to the institutional accreditation, each degree programme to be offered by the private university requires prior accreditation. Furthermore, changes relevant to accreditation require approval by an administrative decision. Therefore, an application for modification of the administrative decision on accreditation needs to be filed. The Agency for Quality Assurance and Accreditation Austria (AQ Austria) is responsible for accreditation.

AQ Austria conducts all accreditation procedures pursuant to the Decree on Accreditation of Private Universities² (PU-AkkVO). Furthermore, the procedures conducted by the Agency are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area.³

AQ Austria appoints experts for the evaluation of accreditation applications. On the basis of the application documents and following a site visit at the applicant institution, the experts draw up a joint review report. The Board of AQ Austria then makes its accreditation decision on the basis of the review report and taking into consideration the applicant institution's comment. If the statutory prerequisites for accreditation are met and the qualitative requirements are satisfied, the submitted degree programme may, by administrative decision, be accredited. In case of a modification of an administrative decision or an extension of an accreditation, accreditation may be granted under conditions.

The Board's administrative decision has to be approved by the Federal Minister for Education, Science and Research prior to its entry into force. After the procedure has been completed, a report on the outcome of the procedure as well as the expert report shall be published on the websites of AQ Austria and the applicant institution.

The legal bases for the accreditation of degree programmes at private universities are the Act on Quality Assurance in Higher Education (HS-QSG)⁴ as well as the Private Universities Act (PUG)⁵.

2 Short information on the accreditation application

Information on the applicant institution	
Applicant institution	CEU GmbH
Legal status	Gesellschaft mit beschränkter Haftung
Name of the private University	Central European University Private University (CEU PU)

² Decree on Accreditation of Private Universities (PU-AkkVO)

³ Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG)

⁴ Act on Quality Assurance in Higher Education (HS-QSG)

⁵ Private Universities Act (PUG)

Site	Vienna
Degree programmes to be accredited	Bachelor of Arts in "Culture, Politics and Society" (CPS) Bachelor of Arts in "Philosophy, Politics and Economics" (PPE) Master of Arts in "International Public Affairs" (IPA) Erasmus Mundus Master of Arts in "Public Policy" (Mundus MAPP) Master of Arts in "Women's and Gender Studies" (GEMMA) Master of Science in "Environmental Sciences, Policy and Management" (MESPOM)
Information on the degree programme	
Name of study programme	"Culture, Politics and Society" (CPS)
Type of study programme	Bachelor programme
ECTS	180
Regular study period	3 years
Maximum intake per year	30 per year per cohort
Academic degree	Bachelor of Arts (B.A.)
Study formate	Fulltime
Language	Englisch
Tuition fee	n.a.
To be accredited for the following location(s)	Vienna
Name of study programme	"Philosophy, Politics and Economics" (PPE)
Type of study programme	Bachelor programme
ECTS	180
Regular study period	3 years
Maximum intake per year	20 per year per cohort
Academic degree	Bachelor of Arts (B.A.)
Study formate	Fulltime
Language	Englisch
Tuition fee	n.a.
To be accredited for the following location(s)	Vienna
Name of study programme	"International Public Affairs" (IPA)
Type of study programme	Master programme
ECTS	120
Regular study period	2 years

Maximum intake per year	20 per year per cohort
Academic degree	Master of Arts (M.A.)
Study formate	Fulltime
Language	Englisch
Tuition fee	n.a.
To be accredited for the following location(s)	Vienna
Name of study programme	"Public Policy" (Mundus MAPP)
Type of study programme	Master programme
ECTS	120
Regular study period	2
Maximum intake per year	25
Academic degree	Master of Arts (M.A.)
Study formate	Fulltime
Language	Englisch
Tuition fee	n.a.
To be accredited for the following location(s)	Vienna
Name of study programme	"Women's and Gender Studies" (GEMMA)
Type of study programme	Joint Master programme
ECTS	120
Regular study period	2 years
Maximum intake per year	10 students for CEU PU per year per cohort
Academic degree	Master of Arts (M.A.)
Study formate	Fulltime
Language	Englisch
Tuition fee	n.a.
To be accredited for the following location(s)	Vienna
Name of study programme	"Environmental Sciences, Policy and Management" (MESPOM)
Type of study programme	Joint Master programme
ECTS	120
Regular study period	2 years
Maximum intake per year	35 per year per cohort
Academic degree	Master of Science (M.Sc.)
Study formate	Fulltime
Language	Englisch
Tuition fee	n.a.

To be accredited for the following location(s)	Vienna
--	--------

The accreditation application was submitted by CEU GmbH on 21.01.2019. As per resolution of 11.04.2019 the Board of AQ Austria has appointed the following experts for the evaluation of the application:

Name	Function and institution	Role within the expert panel
Sybille Reichert	Member of the Science Council & Consulting for Higher Education	reviewer with professional practice management, experience in higher education, chair
Helga Nowotny	Chair of ERA Council Forum Austria	reviewer from academia, expertise in research
Georg Winckler	Former Rector of the University Vienna, EUA	reviewer from academia, management experience in higher education
Maarten Vink	Department of Political Science Maastricht University	Reviewer from academia
Dorota Pietrzyk-Reeves	School of International Studies, Jagiellonian University in Krakow	Reviewer from academia
Christiane Gössinger	Sigmund Freud University	Student

On 5-7 June 2019 the experts and the representative of AQ Austria conducted a site visit at the offices of CEU GmbH in Vienna.

In addition, the Board of AQ Austria has appointed (resolution of 11.04.2019) the following experts contributing to this review process focusing on two of the Joint Master programmes:

Expert for evaluation of programme "MESPOM" (paper-based report)		
Marianne Penker	University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences, Vienna (BOKU)	Reviewer from academia in field of environment and sustainable rural development.
Expert for evaluation of programme "GEMMA" (paper-based report)		
Chia Longman	Ghent University	Reviewer from academia in the field of gender and feminism

3 Explanatory notes of the experts

The following accreditation report presents an unusual case of accreditation in the Austrian system and in the European Higher Education landscape. A European university that has been established in the Hungarian system already in 1991 and that is widely recognized as one of the leading institutions in Europe in the social sciences and humanities is transferring its operation to Austria due to a politically motivated obstruction of its operation in Hungary. The

panel takes note that this accreditation has been the first occasion in the European Union to have been warranted by an explicit attack on academic freedom and liberal democracy.

The accreditation panel is well aware of its obligation to review all documents and information gathered during the site visit as part of an *ex ante* accreditation, judging plans and regulations for the new institution "Central European University Private University" (henceforth CEU PU) Vienna that is being accredited in Austria, rather than evaluating the existing institution CEU-Budapest. Hence, the panel has made considerable efforts to only assess the consistency and solidity of such plans in accordance with the accreditation criteria, and to consider existing practices at CEU-Budapest only where they were reported explicitly to serve as models for the practices which were planned to be established at CEU PU in Vienna.

With respect to the transition period in which the new CEU PU and the pre-existing CEU Budapest will both offer graduate programmes and research, a few features of this phase should be noted. Firstly, the current arrangement whereby all teaching faculty has contracts with the Hungarian entity and is seconded to CEU New York, will continue at first. For the first phase of the transition period, CEU needs to operate under the Hungarian accreditation since the Viennese entity and its programs do not have accreditation yet. Students will be admitted to Hungary and will be studying in Vienna under Schengen provisions. Only upon institutional accreditation, and only for the accredited programs, CEU PU will be able to issue letters of acceptance to students which are required to obtain student visa. Secondly, for the medium term, until 2022, CEU PU plans to offer all existing courses of CEU-Budapest as well as some new programs in Vienna. During this phase, CEU PU and CEU-Budapest will be run in parallel, with a decreasing number of programs being offered in Budapest. In the long-run, however, given the rather small student body and the large amount of courses offered, the institutional leadership emphasized that running a bi-campus teaching model is not deemed to be a sustainable model. Moreover, whether CEU will be able and want to offer some programmes under US and Austrian accreditation in Budapest is as yet unclear. But even if this were the case, its main teaching operation will still be transferred to Vienna.

This being said, before and beyond the accreditation assessment presented in this report, and in light of the unusual circumstances, the panel would like to express its sincere admiration of the ability of CEU Budapest to transform the grievous occasion of a politically imposed obligation to look for an alternative location into a genuine opportunity for development and innovation. Indeed, the institution presented a wide range of ideas and plans as to how to benefit from and contribute to its new location in Vienna and offered many concrete ideas for close cooperation and civic engagement with its new environment. The site visit interviews reflected not only a deep quality culture, but also an openness and academic entrepreneurship that is able to seize opportunities for institutional and academic development wherever they present themselves, on the basis of its institutional mission, the academic visions and ideas of its academic staff, and the eagerness of its managerial staff to seek continuous improvement. There was abundant and credible evidence from the site visit interviews that the push away from Budapest is increasingly seen and experienced as a pull to Vienna. Thus, rather than a coincidental new location, CEU PU in Vienna is becoming a new interpretation of its Central European identity and mission.

In particular, the launch of undergraduate programmes has been taken up by CEU's academics as a welcome opportunity to develop programmes that present new interpretations of CEU's core mission of offering a transformative education for those who will lead and shape an open society, combining research-based critical reflection with civic engagement.

Hence, the panel would like to emphasise that the institutional practices and academic research and teaching offer of CEU presents not just an addition but a welcome enrichment to the Austrian Higher Education landscape, well beyond the accreditation standards that the panel was called to assess. The panel is convinced that CEU PU will offer an institutional quality culture and an array of programmes and institutional practices that will serve as a rich stimulus for its new socio-cultural and institutional environment in Vienna.

4 Statements and assessments based on the assessment criteria pursuant to PU-AkkVO

4.1 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (1): Objectives and profile development

(1) Objectives and profile development

The private university has defined university-relevant objectives and has developed an institutional profile that is in line with these objectives.

According to its development plan, CEU PU aims to be a research-intensive university focusing primarily on the humanities and social sciences, including business and management, law, and public policy, but extending also to interfaces with natural and data sciences. Over the next six years, CEU PU plans to gradually increase its teaching offer from 6 to more than 30 programmes, as well as develop its advanced research and research-based teaching and learning. Such rapid expansion will be achieved by gradually transferring its graduate programs from Budapest to Vienna, reviewing and adapting programmes to the new site and context. Guided by the principle of freedom to pursue academic inquiry, the university plans to promote research that is original, rigorous, and significant. It aims to offer transformative education that is based and driven by research and oriented to civic engagement. CEU PU aims to be recognized in the next six years as one of the best research and teaching institutions in the humanities and social sciences in Europe. The university plans to develop and strengthen its research profile in close connection with its educational activities and offer research-based teaching that is based on close interaction with students in small seminar groups based on student-staff ratios that do not exceed 10 students per academic staff.

Since the applicant institution can refer back to the achievements of CEU-Budapest which will transfer most of its faculty, staff, infrastructure and resources to Vienna in order to lay the foundations for a new university under Austrian jurisdictions, the experts conclude that the university objectives are consistent with the university's profile and that they are credible and achievable, thus **fulfilling** the criterion.

4.2 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (2):Development plan

(2) Development plan

a.The private university has a development plan comprising the fields of studying and teaching, research and/or the advancement and appreciation of the arts, staff, organisation, administration, and quality management.

The development plan includes concrete plans and detailed measures underpinning the establishment of the new university as well as its further development following the establishment. It is based on existing good practices at CEU-Budapest and new additions necessitated by new programs and the transfer of operations to Vienna. The plans comprise details on organisational processes pertaining to academic programmes, support and

administrative services for student and staff, as well as the resources, staff, and infrastructures to underpin such processes. With respect to all dimensions, concrete provisions with respect to the new institution are provided, in addition to examples of practices from CEU Budapest which will be transferred or serve as a model for the new teaching and research offer and services.

Hence, the criterion is **fulfilled**.

(2) Development plan

b. The development plan is in line with the objectives of the institution and can be put into practice with the planned measures and resources.

The development plan is aligned with the objectives of the institution and provides details on how the development measures relate to the objectives, e.g. how the new teaching programmes relate to the profile, mission and priorities of the institution, its research quality standards, teaching philosophy. As stated above, the applicant institution also provides details about the financial and personnel resources needed to realise these objectives, which the panel finds ample, even generous compared to the standards of research-intensive public universities in Austria, to meet the goals. Most of the funding will come from the the CEU Endowment Fund and the Open Society Foundation, with a guarantee provided in respective letters of commitment. Both sources were already available to CEU-Budapest and will be transferred to CEU PU (Vienna). In addition, there will be resources supporting the transfer, both with respect to institutional processes and to compensate additional costs accrued by individual staff and students. Also, staff tasks and contracts lay out clearly how personnel resources support the realization of the plan.

Hence, the experts conclude that the criterion is **fulfilled**.

(2) Development plan

c. The development plan takes gender equality and the advancement of women into account.

Gender Equality is addressed on all levels of university governance, central and departmental. There is a constant monitoring of hiring processes, conference participation plans and committee mandates, on the basis of CEU PU's Equal Opportunity Policy. On the basis of the results, measures are taken to address the existing imbalance at the higher academic ranks of CEU-Budapest where only one of the eight university professors of CEU Budapest (the highest rank achievable at CEU) is female. Since the gender balance at assistant professor level is ensured, institutional measures are targeting the promotion processes from assistant to associate and full professor level. Special mentoring is also offered to young female researchers. The gender equality issue is varies widely across disciplinary fields. CEU PU has precise number on the gender equality and is well aware of this issue. The gender pay gap is also monitored annually and previous imbalances have been successfully redressed. There is also a sexual harassment policy in place.

Given the acute awareness of the gender imbalances which remain and the concrete measures taken to address these imbalances where they exist, which will apply to the CEU PU Vienna as they already apply to CEU Budapest, the panel concludes that the criterion is **fulfilled**.

4.3 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (3): Degree programmes and teaching

(3) Degree programmes and teaching

a. The private university offers a minimum of two bachelor degree programmes with at least one subsequent master degree programme. Diploma programmes accredited at the date of entry into force are treated as master degree programmes. The focus of the studies and/or certificate university programmes is logically related to the institution's objectives and its profile.

CEU PU plans to offer the following degree programs:

1. Bachelor of Arts in Culture, Politics and Society (CPS)
2. Bachelor of Arts in Philosophy, Politics and Economics (PPE)
3. Master of Arts in International Public Affairs (IPA)
4. Erasmus Mundus Master of Arts in Public Policy (Mundus MAPP)
5. Master of Arts in Women's and Gender Studies (GEMMA)
6. Master of Science in Environmental Sciences, Policy and Management (MESPOM)

All programmes will be taught in English. Graduates of the two BA programmes can pursue their MA in one of the four master's programs as there is a clear and logical continuity between them in terms of the curriculum, as well as teaching and learning methods that have been defined. The learning outcomes acquired at the undergraduate level should well prepare students to pursue their master's degrees in the study programmes that are offered. The focus of the programmes is logically related to the institution's objectives and its profile.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

(3) Degree programmes and teaching

b. The private university has defined procedures for the development and establishment of degree programmes.

CEU PU has a *Policy on establishing, operating and modifying degree programs* that is an appendix to the university's statutes. In this policy, the procedures and competences are clearly defined. Furthermore, the policy contains several Annexes, in which certain aspects of the procedures (e.g. information to be included in a proposal for establishing a new degree, programme specification content) are regulated in further detail.

In the policy it is stated that the initiative for the establishment of a new degree programme can come from any academic unit. Once the proposal has been discussed with and approved by the Provost and the Rector, it shall be presented to the Academic Forum and the Senate

Curriculum and Academic Quality Assurance Committee (SeCur), which formulates a recommendation. In a further step, this recommendation along with the programme proposal is submitted to the Senate for approval, before being submitted for accreditation.

The procedures regarding the operation as well as the modification of a degree programme are also clearly defined. The final approval of a new degree programme as well as major modifications to an existing degree programme rests with the Senate.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

In the medium-term CEU might want to consider to expand its BA programmes beyond the existing ones towards developing an even more innovative liberal arts curriculum along the content and standards established by the Colleges of Liberal Arts in the Netherlands.

(3) Degree programmes and teaching

c.The private university ensures that adequate support structures are available for students seeking advice on scientific, study-related organisational, or sociopsychological matters.

CEU's teaching philosophy of a "transformative education" aims to promote intellectual academic competences and knowledge as well as personal development of all students. This philosophy is underpinned by a dense offer of academic and pastoral support services, from academic tutoring, alumni buddies for admitted students, support with visa regulations and finding accommodation, university officials supporting students in dealing with administrative authorities, to a close net of pastoral and psychological care in everyday student life. Such support structures are modelled on the service support culture of the best American or British campus universities, rather than Continental European public universities. The generous support structure is also reflected in a considerably more generous provision of support staff personnel (double or triple the level of support staff per student that is typical of public universities in Austria or Germany). Moreover, the professionalism of the heads of support services, whom the panel interviewed during its site visit and who will be transferred to Vienna, reflects an enabling supportive culture of encouragement that would be the envy of most public continental European universities were they to take a closer look at it.

According to the application, the Dean of Students Office (DoSo) will support students through state-of-the-art facilities, innovative programs, and services related to:

- residence center programming and planning;
- creating a campus culture that promotes academic achievement and personal development;
- providing support for the physical and mental health of students;
- assisting in crisis response;
- planning and carrying out institutional initiatives;
- advising students on a variety of issues related to their academic and non-academic life in Vienna;
- advising students on a variety of issues related to their academic and non-academic life in Vienna.

The Dean of Students will supervise the following offices and services:

- Student Center: create welcoming and courteous atmosphere to assist all students on matters related to Health Insurance and Legal Residence Status
- Community Engagement Office: supports the University's diverse student body by providing opportunities for leadership development, community involvement, and a variety of student life activities
- Student Records Office: provides a wide array of services related to the academic aspect of studying at the University, course management and record-keeping
- Medical Services on campus: English-speaking doctors on duty to hold medical consultation on weekdays
- Psychological Counseling: free confidential student psychological counseling services, providing professional help and support for your personal concerns
- Emergency Services
- Students with Disabilities: provides advice and guidance to students with permanent or temporary disabilities in the process of requesting accommodations from the University.
- Residence Center: provide students assistance with their housing needs
- Student Union: students participate actively in matters of governance and management.

There will be an introductory programme for students who are new to Vienna (1st week) or to the degree programme (2nd week).

Language courses to help develop survival German (or higher levels of proficiency) will be offered to facilitate local integration, but are not mandatory. This practice is already well established in Hungary (for Hungarian) and will be transferred to Vienna (offering German).

The International Office supports student mobility and even cares about the students' parents who may be concerned about students' security and safety.

The academic governance of the university includes student representatives in all committees, including exchanges between students and departmental staff in programme committees to identify and address any suggestions for improvement regarding curricular structures or teaching quality. For almost any kind of questions that are course-related, department coordinators are the first to contact. Students can turn to teaching faculty (office hours are at least 4 hours a week). In addition, the students' voice in the institution is also heard through more informal channels of communication, e.g. in townhall meetings between provost and students, or counseling by teachers who are approached ad hoc by students.

PhD students and faculty will serve as tutors and mentors. In addition to academic mentoring and tutoring, there will also be resident advisors in the residence halls.

Regarding undergraduate admission, the regulations will change quite a bit in comparison with the existing ones for graduate programmes at CEU Budapest. The existing units are currently evaluating what changes will be needed to change when accepting undergraduate students. Regulations for the student dormitories will also be adapted. In the beginning, CEU PU will cooperate with Viennese providers rather than build their own dormitories right away. At a later stage, institutional dormitories will be built.

The panel concludes that the criterion is generously **fulfilled**.

4.4 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 17 (1) a-n: Degree programme and degree programme management – Bachelor of Arts in “Culture, Politics and Society” (CPS)

Degree programme and degree programme management (CPS)

a. The degree programme is aligned with the objectives of the institution and is logically connected with the plan for its development.

This BA programme is very well integrated into the profile of CEU PU whose mission is to offer world class education in social science and humanities with a special emphasis on transformative, multidisciplinary and interdisciplinary education. It also has a very clear civic component that allows students to develop skills which are essential in terms of their future civic commitment and leadership. The new BA programme relates directly to the core objectives of CEU PU, in particular the objective “to produce scholars and professionals, citizens and public leaders who will serve the cause of knowledge-based economic and social development, justice, freedom and tolerance, the values upon which open societies depend” (CEU PU Accreditation Application). CPS’ ambition is to educate critically thinking citizens who will learn interpretation and communication through different media and a variety of courses in social science and humanities that respond to twenty first-century challenges. The programme has well-defined learning outcomes which should equip graduates with sought-after skills and competences including research skills which then open the path to further education at MA and PhD levels and professional careers. CPS is logically connected with the institution’s plans for development as it provides undergraduate education that has clear international focus and is addressed to international candidates.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (CPS)

b. The qualification objectives of the degree programme (learning outcomes of the degree programme) have been clearly defined and meet the scientific and professional requirements and are in accordance with the respective levels of the qualification framework of the European Higher Education Area.

The qualification objectives of this degree programme, including the learning outcomes, have been defined in the programme proposal. The general objectives of the programme, which later are translated into learning outcomes, have been presented in a concise and consistent manner as focusing on three organizing principles that the programme is structured around: 1. broad foundational knowledge of the discipline that leads to specialisation, 2. understanding how knowledge is produced and organized and 3. skills in communication and interpretation methods. The learning outcomes as defined for the programme and its organizing principles include several key components which respond directly to the scientific and professional requirements:

Knowledge (among others):

- demonstrate a basic knowledge of the major theoretical schools and approaches characterizing a given academic discipline

- apply key analytical concepts of a variety of disciplinary traditions in the social sciences and humanities.

Skills (among others):

- critically interpret and analyse texts (both written and visual) from a variety of critical frameworks
- apply a variety of social science research methods to solve a conceptual problem.

Competences (among others):

- “present findings and communicate disciplinary knowledge through a variety of media and communication genres, from textual to audio and visual.
- collaborate effectively in a variety of circumstances, from working as part of a team to contributing to an academic discussion.”

More specific learning outcomes have been defined for each programme module and each individual courses within the modules as well as for the final capstone project.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (CPS)

c. The name of the degree programme corresponds to the qualification profile.

The name of the programme, BA in "Culture, Politics and Society", corresponds well to the qualification profile as it indicates the clear focus on the interdisciplinary character of the programme curriculum which spans certain key areas of research in culture, society and politics. It relates to the intersection between them, and allows students to broaden "their creative ability to critically interpret and communicate through the written word and through images as well as audio, and other emerging technologies." Although quite general, the programme name allows for both focus on key areas in major social science disciplines and interdisciplinary approach to the studied phenomena.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (CPS)

d. The students are involved in an appropriate manner in shaping the teaching and learning processes. They are encouraged to be actively involved in the learning process.

In line with CEU-PU's overall teaching philosophy, students have to prepare for and play an active role in every class. Students are not perceived as passive recipients of the professors' wisdom, but are strongly encouraged to actively participate in shaping their learning process. There is a well-established procedure at CEU for quality control and incorporation of student feedback (e.g. based on course questionnaires and feedback by student representatives to

course directors, programme directors and the department chair), as evident from the submitted documentation and confirmed by the teaching faculty at the site visit.

The students' representation in the Senate as well as the students' board and students' representatives in each department can actively participate in shaping the teaching and learning process, which also takes place through the formal institutional mechanisms of regular evaluation of all courses and their instructors. As the panel has learned, all individual cases can be discussed at the departmental level and if necessary transferred to higher levels of the university administration.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (CPS)

e. The contents, structure and scope of and the teaching method applied to the curriculum and the modules meet the scientific and professional requirements and are suited to achieve the intended learning outcomes. They furthermore take into account the requirements of a diversified student body.

The institution is planning to "experiment with and introduce, when suitable, new teaching and learning approaches, for example: integration of new technologies and blended teaching and learning, visual and digital techniques, increased focus on the importance of research methods, data and quantitative literacy, interdisciplinary scholarship, research- and problem-based teaching and learning, or flexible study options" (Accreditation Application). This seems to apply especially to the BA programme in Culture, Politics and Society whose intended learning outcomes and learning objectives require a mixture of more traditional and innovative teaching methods applied to the curriculum and modules. The methods also take into account the requirements of a diversified student body, for they allow to apply context-specific approaches and transformative learning in a multicultural setting.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (CPS)

f. The academic degree to be awarded is comparable on an international scale.

The academic degree to be awarded is a well-defined Bachelor of Arts in social science with a liberal arts component. It is similar to other international interdisciplinary bachelors programmes taught in English, but offers a particularly rich curriculum that allows for a choice of specialisation from over ten different tracks.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (CPS)

g. The application of the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS) is adequate and plausible.

For the overall programme 180 ECTS are required. In each year, students are required to complete 60 ECTS. In the first year, all courses are mandatory. In the second and third year, modules with a total of 104 ECTS are being offered respectively. Students must earn 8 ECTS in each module, including mandatory courses, thus providing flexibility regarding the ECTS distribution within the first and second term. 1 ECTS equals 30 hours of workload, which lies within the adequate range (25-30 hours).

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (CPS)

h. The students' workload required for the degree programme is devised in a way so as to allow them to reach the intended qualification objectives in the study period specified. The organisation of the degree programme and the students' workload of a part-time degree programme can be reconciled with a regular job.

The overall workload (180 ECTS, with 1 ECTS being equivalent to 30 hours) lies on the upper end of the adequate range. Especially the first and second term of each year are very workload-intensive. Courses are generally held on a weekly basis and attendance is mandatory. One ECTS credit is equal to 6.25 hours of classroom presence and 23.75 hours of out-of-class work.

Although the required workload is to be considered demanding, it can still be accomplished and allows the students to reach the intended qualification objectives in three years.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (CPS)

i. The Private University has adopted examination rules. The examination methods are suitable to assess whether the defined learning outcomes have been achieved.

The examination rules at the university level are adopted by the university and explained in the *Student Rights, Rules and Academic Regulations*. The BA in Culture, Politics and Society is an undergraduate interdisciplinary programme for which specific examination rules have been defined in course syllabi. They include a variety of methods to assess whether intended learning outcomes have been achieved. These range from typical final written exams, mid-term exams, home-taken exams to essays, presentations and other assignments. Typically a combination of these methods is used to evaluate student's knowledge, skills and competences as determined by the course requirements.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (CPS)

j. A "diploma supplement" that complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 2 to the University Student Records Decree (Universitäts-Studienevidenzverordnung) of the Federal Ministry of Science, Research and Economy will be issued.

CEU PU plans to issue diploma supplements to its graduates. The accreditation documents provided to the panel contain an exemplary diploma supplement for each of the programmes (bachelor and master level), which are compliant with the legal requirements.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (CPS)

k. Admission requirements and the admission procedure are clearly defined. In terms of the qualification level, admission requirements meet at least the provisions laid down in the University Act 2002, Federal Law Gazette I 2002/120 as amended.

Admission requirements and the admission procedure have been clearly defined and explained and meet the criteria laid down in the University Act 2002. The requirements include three major components: a proof of the English language proficiency which is clearly specified; 2. Academic competence as reflected in school diploma and transcript; 3. Academic potential of candidates that can be evaluated during interviews. The procedure is consistent with the institution's profile and development plans as it aims at attracting the best candidates from all over the world.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (CPS)

l. The private university provides the public with easily accessible information on the general conditions for student agreements which each student has to sign.

During the site visit CEU PU convincingly conveyed its intention to publish all legally required documents on the university's website (see also §14 (9)).

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (CPS)

m. Adequate support structures are available for students seeking advice on scientific, specialist, study-related organisational, or sociopsychological matters.

For all students, mentor groups are formed to support student learning processes. For the beginning phase of each programme, bridging courses help students whose previous specialisation may not have prepared them for all aspects of the programme, get to the required level. Students meet regularly with their teaching staff or mentors and can address department heads or programme coordinators in case of questions or complaints regarding their programme. An academic writing center with classes for students who need support (upon individual assessment) is provided at the beginning of each programme. Throughout the programme, students can schedule appointments for improving their writing style, e.g. when preparing course work.

The Student Life Center supports students in all extra-curricular and personal matters, from helping with visa, accommodation or insurance matters at the beginning of their programme to pastoral and psychological care during it (for further details see §14 (3) c). A career platform and service supports the search for internships (which are also often found through the help of academic staff contacts) or helps career entry, e.g. guidance for writing cover letters.

There is also a medical service for students, visa, opportunities for internship, help with cover letter, career platforms, career advisor.

With respect to financial needs, in addition to the financial aid provided in some form or another to a majority of students, there are flexible responses to students' funding needs that occur in the course of the programme, such as support for internships abroad, field research etc.. PhD candidates can spend time at partner universities with financial support from CEU as well as stipends for field research or travel money for presenting papers at conferences.

The support structures for advice on scientific, specialist, study-related organisational, or psychological matters are more than adequate. Hence the criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (CPS)

n. If e-learning, blended learning and distance learning are part of the programme, suitable didactic, technical, organisational and financial preconditions have been created to ensure the achievement of the degree programme's qualification objectives.

According to the application documents and as confirmed at the site visit by the programme faculty, there is no need for suitable didactic, technical, organisational and financial preconditions for e-learning, blended learning and distance learning, as all teaching takes place at the premises of the university.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

4.5 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 17 (1) a-n: Degree programme and degree programme management – Bachelor of Arts in “Philosophy, Politics and Economics” (PPE)

Degree programme and degree programme management (PPE)

a. The degree programme is aligned with the objectives of the institution and is logically connected with the plan for its development.

The new BA programme on Philosophy, Politics and Economics (PPE) relates directly to the core objectives of CEU PU, in particular the objective “to produce scholars and professionals, citizens and public leaders who will serve the cause of knowledge-based economic and social development, justice, freedom and tolerance, the values upon which open societies depend” (Mission, CEU PU Accreditation Application). Following the traditional multidisciplinary PPE model, students will be trained as reflective and socially engaged scholars, which will be applicable in a diversity of careers and prepare for enrolment in a large variety of subsequent masters at CEU and elsewhere. The scope of the programme allows it to incorporate the CEU’s excellence in the fields of philosophy, political science and economics into the teaching faculty of the programme.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (PPE)

b. The qualification objectives of the degree programme (learning outcomes of the degree programme) have been clearly defined and meet the scientific and professional requirements and are in accordance with the respective levels of the qualification framework of the European Higher Education Area.

The qualification objectives (learning outcomes) of the degree programme are clearly defined and cover, in a general sense, knowledge, analytical skills and additional communication and rhetorical skills. The programme learning outcomes are the following:

Having completed this programme, students will have:

- a detailed knowledge of the foundations of contemporary economics
- a detailed knowledge of the main elements of political science
- a detailed knowledge of the central areas of contemporary philosophy and its historical origins
- acquired the ability to analyse and critically assess a wide range of arguments and debates
- developed the ability to work independently, to research their own interests, and to present their work in public
- a good background to pursue Master’s degrees in the disciplines in which they specialise.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Recommendations: The above mentioned objectives are still formulated in a rather generic manner, they were clarified in a satisfactory manner during the site visit. It is recommendable

to define the qualification objectives at the programme level in a more detailed level and to ensure that all objectives are clearly implemented through the various curriculum components.

Degree programme and degree programme management (PPE)

c. The name of the degree programme corresponds to the qualification profile.

The programme qualification profile clearly reflects what is traditionally understood as a PPE undergraduate programme with an equally strong focus on courses from philosophy, political science and economics, and a specialisation in one of these three disciplines with a secondary focus on one other discipline.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (PPE)

d. The students are involved in an appropriate manner in shaping the teaching and learning processes. They are encouraged to be actively involved in the learning process.

In line with CEU's overall teaching philosophy, students have to prepare for and play an active role in every class. Students are not perceived as passive recipients of the professors' wisdom, but are strongly encouraged to actively participate in shaping their learning process. There is a well-established procedure at CEU for quality control and incorporation of student feedback (e.g. based on course questionnaires and feedback by student representatives to course directors, programme directors and the department chair), as evident from the submitted documentation and confirmed by the teaching faculty and students at the site visit.

The students' representation in the Senate as well as the students' board and students' representatives in each department can actively participate in shaping the teaching and learning process, which also takes place through the formal institutional mechanisms of regular evaluation of all courses and their instructors. As the panel has learned, all individual cases can be discussed at the departmental level and if necessary transferred to higher levels of the university administration.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (PPE)

e. The contents, structure and scope of and the teaching method applied to the curriculum and the modules meet the scientific and professional requirements and are suited to achieve the intended learning outcomes. They furthermore take into account the requirements of a diversified student body.

The curriculum is well-structured, with a basic introduction to the three subjects (philosophy, politics, economics) in the first year, continued study and specialisation in two disciplines in

years 2 and 3. There is a good mix of compulsory and optional courses focused on knowledge (concepts, theories etc), methods as well as skills oriented courses, such as academic writing.

Students take ten modules out of twelve available: three in each of the first two years, and four in the third, with an increasing amount of choice as students progress through the programme. In their first year, students take three introductory 20 credit modules to the three disciplines: philosophy, politics and economics. In addition, they take a course on academic writing. In their second year, students choose to focus on two of these disciplines, and take two 20 credit modules, one in each of their choices. In addition, they take a 20 credit module of optional courses from those offered across CEU PU, to broaden their learning and educational experience. In their third year, students continue with their two chosen disciplines, taking two modules of elective (optional) courses, of 16 credits each. The multi-disciplinary programme is completed with a 12 ECTS thesis (6000 words).

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

The panel recommends insuring a more explicit constructive alignment between the programme qualification objectives and the intended learning outcomes of the respective courses.

Degree programme and degree programme management (PPE)

f. The academic degree to be awarded is comparable on an international scale.

The academic degree of Bachelor of Arts (BA) in Philosophy, Politics and Economics corresponds to the programme title, the curriculum and is comparable to similar study programs in international context.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (PPE)

g. The application of the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS) is adequate and plausible.

The application of ECTS for the overall programme is adequate with a division of 60 ECTS per year, adding up to 180 ECTS for the whole programme, in line with the framework. There is a minor inconsistency in the proposed distribution of ECTS between the terms in the first year, with 28 ECTS instead of 24 ECTS in the first term, as in the other years (and only 8 ECTS in the third term). One pragmatic solution to this inconsistency, as discussed with faculty during the site visit, might be to spread the 'academic writing' course across the terms with completion in the third term.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (PPE)

h. The students' workload required for the degree programme is devised in a way so as to allow them to reach the intended qualification objectives in the study period specified. The organisation of the degree programme and the students' workload of a part-time degree programme can be reconciled with a regular job.

The overall workload (180 ECTS, with 1 ECTS being equivalent to 30 hours) lies on the upper end of the adequate range. Especially the first and second term of each year are very workload-intensive. Courses are generally held on a weekly basis and attendance is mandatory. One ECTS credit is equal to 6.25 hours of classroom presence and 23.75 hours of out-of-class work.

Although the required workload could be considered demanding, it can still be accomplished and allows the students to reach the intended qualification objectives in three years.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (PPE)

i. The Private University has adopted examination rules. The examination methods are suitable to assess whether the defined learning outcomes have been achieved.

The University has adopted examination rules and methods, which are overall defined in the *Student Rights, Rules and Academic Regulations* document. The general forms of examination consist of closed book, open book, take-home and restricted examinations and may be conducted in writing or orally.

The specific examination rules and methods for the BA in Philosophy, Politics and Economics (PPE) are defined in the course syllabi of the programme. To assess whether the intended learning outcomes have been achieved, a variety of examination methods are used. These range from final written exams, mid-term exams, take-home exams and essays, presentations and other assignments. Typically, a combination of such methods is used to evaluate students' knowledge, skills and competences as determined in the intended learning outcomes of each course.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (PPE)

j. A "diploma supplement" that complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 2 to the University Student Records Decree (Universitäts-Studienerevidenzverordnung) of the Federal Ministry of Science, Research and Economy will be issued.

CEU PU plans to issue diploma supplements to its graduates. The accreditation documents provided to the panel contain an exemplary diploma supplement for each of the programmes (bachelor and master level), which are compliant with the legal requirements.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (PPE)

k. Admission requirements and the admission procedure are clearly defined. In terms of the qualification level, admission requirements meet at least the provisions laid down in the University Act 2002, Federal Law Gazette I 2002/120 as amended.

Admission requirements and the admission procedure are clearly defined. In order to be admitted to the degree programme, a strong academic record and proof of ability in mathematics is needed, as well as English language proficiency, which is clearly specified in terms of minimum scores on various English language tests. The admission procedure consists of an online application form, with sections to include evidence of the requirements, as well as a CV and motivation letter. The application is followed by a virtual or in-person admissions interview.

The qualification level asked for by the admission requirements meets and exceeds the provisions laid down in the University Act 2002.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (PPE)

I. The private university provides the public with easily accessible information on the general conditions for student agreements which each student has to sign.

During the site visit CEU PU convincingly conveyed its intention to publish all legally required documents on the university's website (see also § 14 (9)).

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (PPE)

m. Adequate support structures are available for students seeking advice on scientific, specialist, study-related organisational, or sociopsychological matters.

For all students, mentor groups are formed to support student learning processes. For the beginning phase of each programme, bridging courses help students whose previous specialisation may not have prepared them for all aspects of the programme, get to the required level. Students meet regularly with their teaching staff or mentors and can address department heads or programme coordinators in case of questions or complaints regarding their programme. An academic writing center with classes for students who need support (upon individual assessment) is provided at the beginning of each programme. Throughout the programme, students can schedule appointments for improving their writing style, e.g. when preparing course work.

The Student Life Center supports students in all extra-curricular and personal matters, from helping with visa, accommodation or insurance matters at the beginning of their programme to pastoral and psychological care during it (for further details see §14 (3) c). A career platform and service supports the search for internships (which are also often found through the help of academic staff contacts) or helps career entry, e.g. guidance for writing cover letters.

There is also a medical service for students, visa, opportunities for internship, help with cover letter, career platforms, career advisor.

With respect to financial needs, in addition to the financial aid provided in some form or another to a majority of students, there are flexible responses to students' funding needs that occur in the course of the programme, such as support for internships abroad, field research etc.. PhD candidates can spend time at partner universities with financial support from CEU as well as stipends for field research or travel money for presenting papers at conferences.

The support structures for advice on scientific, specialist, study-related organisational, or psychological matters are more than adequate. Hence the criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (PPE)

n. If e-learning, blended learning and distance learning are part of the programme, suitable didactic, technical, organisational and financial preconditions have been created to ensure the achievement of the degree programme's qualification objectives.

According to the application documents and as confirmed at the site visit by the programme faculty, there is no need for suitable didactic, technical, organisational and financial preconditions for e-learning, blended learning and distance learning, as all teaching takes place at the premises of the university.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

4.6 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 17 (1) a-n: Degree programme and degree programme management – Master of Arts in "International Public Affairs" (IPA)

Degree programme and degree programme management (IPA)

a. The degree programme is aligned with the objectives of the institution and is logically connected with the plan for its development.

The content and design of the MA programme in International Public Affairs corresponds well with the profile of the university and its strategic plans as regards offering excellent research-oriented education at the MA level. It is built upon the strength of its academic staff in terms of research and teaching potential and is meant to provide interdisciplinary and transformative education to a group of carefully selected students. The programme supports CEU PU's mission to provide education that equips students not only with broad knowledge of

international processes, but also with critical thinking skills and the ability to engage in problem solving globally. Another important aspect is the programme's ambition to prepare its graduates to a number of professional paths including those which are strongly related with community service and civic engagement e.g. NGOs and INGOs. The programme is directly related to the CEU PU's core objectives "to produce research that transforms our understanding of the world and to produce scholars and professionals, citizens and public leaders who will serve the cause of knowledge-based economic and social development, justice, freedom and tolerance, the values upon which open societies depend" (CEU PU Accreditation Application, Mission).

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (IPA)

b. The qualification objectives of the degree programme (learning outcomes of the degree programme) have been clearly defined and meet the scientific and professional requirements and are in accordance with the respective levels of the qualification framework of the European Higher Education Area.

The objectives of the programme including learning outcomes have been defined in the programme proposal as "abilities of students to demonstrate certain understandings, skills or competencies after graduation" in accordance with the requirements of the framework of the European Higher Education Area. It has been stressed by CEU that the programme learning outcomes and objectives are both multi and interdisciplinary. Three essential programme learning objectives have been defined in the programme proposal:

1. A solid foundation in international public affairs which includes the ability to understand and work with the core research methods in public policy, international relations, comparative politics, and economics.
2. Interdisciplinary skills that allow working with interdisciplinary research that crosses disciplinary boundaries, including a strong humanities/history component.
3. Advanced skills as interdisciplinary researchers.

While these objectives are formulated in a rather generic manner, they were clarified in a satisfactory manner during the site visit.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

It is recommendable to define the qualification objectives at the programme level in more detail and to ensure that all objectives are clearly implemented through the various curriculum components. There is no doubt that these learning objectives, defined at the programme level, correspond with specific learning outcomes (described as "learning goals" in the Programme proposal) designed for programme modules and courses. One key learning goal has been provided for each module followed by specific learning outcomes that are built into individual courses which the modules are comprised of. For example, the Foundation Module has one broadly defined learning outcome: "students should achieve a foundation in international public affairs, by studying introductory masters-level courses in political science, economics, international relations and public policy that prepares them for interdisciplinary work in the subsequent modules". All courses that comprise the module provide specific learning outcomes, for example Policy Analysis' intended learning outcomes include:

- "identify policy problems and critically engage with them with various analytical tools and methods.
- understand key concepts in policy studies and apply them to/in specific problems/contexts
- understand, articulate and critically discuss how policy issues are problematized and policy responses are designed, implemented, monitored and evaluated in different contexts
- identify key actors and institutions structuring the policy process."

Degree programme and degree programme management (IPA)

c. The name of the degree programme corresponds to the qualification profile.

The name of the programme "International Public Affairs" corresponds very well to the qualification profile as it refers to three major components that constitute the programme's curriculum and objectives. It captures an international focus (regional, transnational and global) and a public dimension and is clearly linked with the CEU PU's mission and profile. "International Public Affairs" as a concept indicates not only rigorous study of international relations, but also processes that are policy-oriented and involve various publics.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (IPA)

d. The students are involved in an appropriate manner in shaping the teaching and learning processes. They are encouraged to be actively involved in the learning process.

In line with CEU's overall teaching philosophy, students have to prepare for and play an active role in every class. Students are not perceived as passive recipients of the professors' wisdom, but are strongly encouraged to actively participate in shaping their learning process. There is a well-established procedure at CEU for quality control and incorporation of student feedback (e.g. based on course questionnaires and feedback by student representatives to course directors, programme directors and the department chair), as evident from the submitted documentation and confirmed by the teaching faculty and students at the site visit.

The students' representation in the Senate as well as the students' board and students' representatives in each department can actively participate in shaping the teaching and learning process, which also takes place through the formal institutional mechanisms of regular evaluation of all courses and their instructors. As the panel has learned, all individual cases can be discussed at the departmental level and if necessary transferred to higher levels of the university administration.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (IPA)

e. The contents, structure and scope of and the teaching method applied to the curriculum and the modules meet the scientific and professional requirements and are suited to achieve the intended learning outcomes. They furthermore take into account the requirements of a diversified student body.

The programme's structure and scope concentrate around several general modules mandatory to all students (Foundation module, Research methods and Thesis) and two major tracks – Democracy and Rule of Law, and Policy and Governance. As the overall learning objectives require that students should "develop advanced skills as interdisciplinary researchers that prepare them for careers in international organisations, NGOs, or public administration, or related fields such as journalism and academia" (Course Proposal), the teaching methods that are used become quite important. It was confirmed during the site visit that although the description of teaching methods is the same for all courses offered (which reads as follow: "The course is mainly seminar-based. It will include some lectures on relevant concepts. The sessions involve student participation in the form of short presentations and seminar-style discussions, case studies and/or exercises based on the course literature"), it allows individual lecturers to use many different methods that are the most suitable to achieve intended learning outcomes, such as projects, workshops, or problem based-learning. Course syllabi in fact provide for such a variety as they design different methods of assessment depending on the courses' structure and objectives. Seminar based learning also allows for adequate methods of teaching among a diversified student body, in this case an expected truly international group of students.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (IPA)

f. The academic degree to be awarded is comparable on an international scale.

The academic degree to be awarded is a well-defined Master of Arts degree in social science with an interdisciplinary focus and a humanities component which is similar to other international English-taught and research oriented masters degrees in social science and the humanities.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (IPA)

g. The application of the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS) is adequate and plausible.

The programme applies the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS) in a consistent manner. Students are required to complete 120 ECTS points during two years of studies (60 ECTS in each year). The ECTS points are distributed among modules and courses for which students typically earn 4 ECTS. More specifically, students must complete the Foundation Module (32 ECTS); at least 32 ECTS in a chosen specialisation; 8 ECTS in the Research Module and 24

ECTS for completion of their thesis and thesis seminar. They earn the remaining credits in elective courses including optional internship.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (IPA)

h. The students' workload required for the degree programme is devised in a way so as to allow them to reach the intended qualification objectives in the study period specified. The organisation of the degree programme and the students' workload of a part-time degree programme can be reconciled with a regular job.

The overall workload (120 ECTS, with 1 ECTS being equivalent to 30 hours) lies on the upper end of the adequate range. In each year, the achievement of least 60 ECTS is intended. Especially the first term of each year is very workload-intensive. Courses are generally held on a weekly basis and attendance is mandatory. One ECTS credit is equal to 5 hours of classroom presence and 25 hours of out of class work.

Although the required workload is to be considered demanding, it can still be accomplished and allows the students to reach the intended qualification objectives in two years.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (IPA)

i. The Private University has adopted examination rules. The examination methods are suitable to assess whether the defined learning outcomes have been achieved.

The methods of examination of the Master of Arts in International Public Affairs are explained in each course syllabus and they correspond with the intended learning outcomes. They include a variety of ways to assess whether defined learning outcomes have been achieved such as position paper, final argumentative paper, different types of examinations, review papers and source-based essays, as well as more specific forms of assessment for methodology courses. Typically a combination of methods is used to evaluate students' knowledge, skills and competences in all courses including final MA thesis. The university has also established rules as regards the required grade point average (GPA) average upon graduation.

This criterion is **fulfilled**

Degree programme and degree programme management (IPA)

j. A "diploma supplement" that complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 2 to the University Student Records Decree (Universitäts-Studienevidenzverordnung) of the Federal Ministry of Science, Research and Economy will be issued.

CEU PU plans to issue diploma supplements to its graduates. The accreditation documents provided to the panel contain an exemplary diploma supplement for each of the programmes (bachelor and master level), which are compliant with the legal requirements.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (IPA)

k. Admission requirements and the admission procedure are clearly defined. In terms of the qualification level, admission requirements meet at least the provisions laid down in the University Act 2002, Federal Law Gazette I 2002/120 as amended.

Admissions' requirements and the admissions procedure have been clearly defined and explained and meet the criteria laid down in the University Act 2002. The requirements for this MA programme include a BA degree in a similar discipline, excellent academic record, letters of motivation and recommendation as well as individual assessment of candidate's academic potential and achievements. All required documents are to be uploaded to the university addmissions website.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (IPA)

I. The private university provides the public with easily accessible information on the general conditions for student agreements which each student has to sign.

During the site visit CEU PU convincingly conveyed its intention to publish all legally required documents on the university's website (see also § 14 (9)).

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (IPA)

m. Adequate support structures are available for students seeking advice on scientific, specialist, study-related organisational, or sociopsychological matters.

For all students, mentor groups are formed to support student learning processes. For the beginning phase of each programme, bridging courses help students whose previous specialisation may not have prepared them for all aspects of the programme, get to the

required level. Students meet regularly with their teaching staff or mentors and can address department heads or programme coordinators in case of questions or complaints regarding their programme. An academic writing center with classes for students who need support (upon individual assessment) is provided at the beginning of each programme. Throughout the programme, students can schedule appointments for improving their writing style, e.g. when preparing course work.

The Student Life Center supports students in all extra-curricular and personal matters, from helping with visa, accommodation or insurance matters at the beginning of their programme to pastoral and psychological care during it (for further details see §14 (3) c). A career platform and service supports the search for internships (which are also often found through the help of academic staff contacts) or helps career entry, e.g. guidance for writing cover letters.

There is also a medical service for students, visa, opportunities for internship, help with cover letter, career platforms, career advisor.

With respect to financial needs, in addition to the financial aid provided in some form or another to a majority of students, there are flexible response to students' funding needs that occur in the course of the programme, such as support for internships abroad, field research etc.. PhD candidates can spend time at partner universities with financial support from CEU as well as stipends for field research or travel money for presenting papers at conferences.

The support structures for advice on scientific, specialist, study-related organisational, or psychological matters are more than adequate. Hence the criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (IPA)

n. If e-learning, blended learning and distance learning are part of the programme, suitable didactic, technical, organisational and financial preconditions have been created to ensure the achievement of the degree programme's qualification objectives.

According to the application documents and as confirmed at the site visit by the programme faculty, there is no need for suitable didactic, technical, organisational and financial preconditions for e-learning, blended learning and distance learning, as all teaching takes place at the premises of the university. Social media (e.g. Facebook group) are used for community exchange within the international joint master.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

4.7 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 17 (1) a-p: Degree programme and degree programme management – Erasmus Mundus Master of Arts in “Public Policy” (Mundus MAPP)

Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP)

a. The degree programme is aligned with the objectives of the institution and is logically connected with the plan for its development.

The Erasmus Mundus MA programme on Public Policy (MAPP), building on existing international cooperation since 2007, relates directly to the core objectives of CEU PU, in particular the objective “to produce scholars and professionals, citizens and public leaders who will serve the cause of knowledge-based economic and social development, justice, freedom and tolerance, the values upon which open societies depend” (Mission, CEU PU Accreditation Application). MAPP aims at “a detailed and systematic understanding of how political institutions, processes and public policies operate and interact from the global political economy through to national and local levels with a direct focus on European engagements at these levels of governance.” MAPP prepares graduates for international professional careers as policy makers, policy analysts and advisors in either politics, civil service, international organisations or the corporate and non-governmental sectors. As programme under the Erasmus Mundus Joint Masters Degree under the European Union’s Erasmus+ Programme, MAPP contributes to the goal of the CEU PU as a network university.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP)

b. The qualification objectives of the degree programme (learning outcomes of the degree programme) have been clearly defined and meet the scientific and professional requirements and are in accordance with the respective levels of the qualification framework of the European Higher Education Area.

The learning outcomes are clearly defined and are in accordance with the European qualification framework. The qualification objectives of the programme focus, respectively, on:

- knowledge and understanding (public policy formation, the functioning of supranational institutions and coordination mechanisms; European and other international governance models and regimes; national, transnational and international policy as well as European and global processes; the political, economic, legal, geopolitical and social implications of the formulation of public policies; conceptual advancement in social science theories of the policy process, international relations, the tendencies of international development and the dynamics between these fields of social science theories)
- application of knowledge and understanding/problem-solving abilities (critically analysing policy issues and developing holistic perspectives on European governance and global governance; evaluating public policies and policy instruments with quantitative and qualitative methods; independently formulating relevant research topics, developing preliminary hypotheses and ideas, conducting data collection and analysis, designing investigation procedures and preparing scientifically sound and

effective reports on research outcomes; providing expert advice to decision makers in national and international fora relying on an understanding of institutional contexts; designing and participating in the delivery of public policies in various sectors and institutional settings)

- personal capabilities and competences (interact with expertise in various fields related to public policy and governance; provide critical analysis of policy studies and related literature; competence in using statistical data, quantitative methods, and qualitative methods; leadership skills and cultural sensitivity; appreciate and acknowledge the need for integrity and ethical conduct in public service; use library, electronic and on-line information resources with confidence; make written and oral presentations to specialist and non-specialist audiences; work in multidisciplinary, multicultural teams; speak, read and write English at professional and academic level; continuously improve professional knowledge through individual learning, self-development and self-evaluation)

These objectives are clearly linked to the core and track-specific and elective elements of the programme, as detailed in the Programme Guide.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP)

c. The name of the degree programme corresponds to the qualification profile.

The name of 'Public Policy' adequately reflects the qualification profile of the programme and the curriculum.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP)

d. The students are involved in an appropriate manner in shaping the teaching and learning processes. They are encouraged to be actively involved in the learning process.

In line with CEU's overall teaching philosophy, students have to prepare for and play an active role in every class. Students are not perceived as passive recipients of the professors' wisdom, but are strongly encouraged to actively participate in shaping their learning process. There is a well-established procedure at CEU for quality control and incorporation of student feedback (e.g. based on course questionnaires and feedback by student representatives to course directors, programme directors and the department chair), as evident from the submitted documentation and confirmed by the teaching faculty at the site visit. Active learning is an essential element of the joint degree programme, including the partner universities, with a focus on making written and oral presentations; collaborating in multidisciplinary, multicultural teams; and speaking, reading and writing English at professional and academic level.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Note: This assessment refers to the GEMMA programme too (see paper-based report below).

Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP)

e. The contents, structure and scope of and the teaching method applied to the curriculum and the modules meet the scientific and professional requirements and are suited to achieve the intended learning outcomes. They furthermore take into account the requirements of a diversified student body.

The curriculum of the joint master is well-structured with a uniform core of policy studies as well as modules specific to particular mobility tracks, drawn predominantly from the fields of international relations, European Studies and Development Studies. At CEU PU the students are allowed to specialise in European and Global Public Policy, respectively. This involves a study in year 1 at CEU PU and in year 2 at, respectively, University of York, UK or at Institute Barcelona d'Estudis Internacionals, Spain.

General core courses are mandatory for all students and fully harmonised across the two academic years and four consortium institutions. All Mundus MAPP graduates will have taken these subjects, considered as the core theoretical foundation of policy studies, regardless of the respective mobility track. The courses, divided between year 1 and year 2, focus on policy analysis; economics for public policy; global governance; public management and research methods.

Track-specific core courses are obligatory for students choosing to take a particular mobility path, and are the main instrument for differentiation within Mundus MAPP. The combinations of consortium universities allow students to specialise in Global Public Policy (with IBEI) and European Public Policy (with York).

Students are provided with advanced research design and methodological skills through the Quantitative and Qualitative Methods core courses, thesis workshops, and the mentoring of significant research projects.

The study trip (field trip) is a joint activity in the first academic year, mandatory for all students regardless of their mobility path.

The multi-disciplinary programme is completed with a 20 ECTS thesis (12000 words, +/- 10%).

The specific content of the modules is outlined clearly in the Program Guide, including specific learning outcomes.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP)

f. The academic degree to be awarded is comparable on an international scale.

The academic degree of "Master of Arts (MA) in Public Policy" corresponds to the programme title, the curriculum and is comparable to similar study programs on an international context.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP)

g. The application of the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS) is adequate and plausible.

The application of ECTS for the overall programme is adequate with a division of 60 ECTS per year, adding up to 120 ECTS for the whole two-year programme.

Progression to year 2 of the programme is dependent on obtaining 60 ECTS credits in year 1. This must include all year 1 core, track-specific and elective courses/modules, (including the study visit and the thesis report), and may be following reassessment. Students must obtain 60 ECTS credits in year 2 at partner institute of IBEI or York. The thesis report and thesis are supervised and examined by a member of faculty each from the two institutions (CEU PU and partner institute) in the student's mobility track.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP)

h. The students' workload required for the degree programme is devised in a way so as to allow them to reach the intended qualification objectives in the study period specified. The organisation of the degree programme and the students' workload of a part-time degree programme can be reconciled with a regular job.

The overall workload (1 ECTS being equivalent to 30 hours) lies on the upper end of the adequate range. In each the first year, the achievement of least 61 ECTS is intended at CEU PU and 60 ECTS in the second year. CEU PU students are thus required to achieve 121 ECTS in total, which is 1 ECTS more than the typical overall workload for a master programme. This is due to the ECTS of the joint programme elements and CEU PU using only even numbers for its ECTS calculations. Nevertheless, the number of credits is to be considered adequate for a master programme.

Courses at CEU PU are generally held on a weekly basis and attendance is mandatory. One ECTS credit is equal to 5 hours of classroom presence and 25 hours of out of class work. The workload for CEU PU students in each term of the programme ranges from 16 to 24 ECTS credits, thus being fairly evenly distributed throughout the duration of the programme.

Altogether the workload is demanding but can be accomplished and allows students to reach the intended qualification objectives in two years.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP)

i. The Private University has adopted examination rules. The examination methods are suitable to assess whether the defined learning outcomes have been achieved.

The University has adopted examination rules and methods, which are overall defined in the *Student Rights, Rules and Academic Regulations* document. The specific examination rules and methods for the Erasmus Mundus Masters Program in Public Policy (Mundus MAPP) are defined in the course syllabi of the programme. This applies to the courses offered at CEU PU as well as the courses offered at the partner universities in York and Barcelona. A variety of assessment methods are being used, which range from final written exams to essays, presentations, research papers and other assignments. Typically, a combination of such methods is used to evaluate students' knowledge, skills and competences corresponding to the intended learning outcomes of each course. The examination methods are well suited to evaluate the achievement of the defined learning outcomes.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP)

j. A "diploma supplement" that complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 2 to the University Student Records Decree (Universitäts-Studienevidenzverordnung) of the Federal Ministry of Science, Research and Economy will be issued.

CEU PU plans to issue diploma supplements to its graduates. The accreditation documents provided to the panel contain an exemplary diploma supplement for each of the programmes (bachelor and master level), which are compliant with the legal requirements.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP)

k. Admission requirements and the admission procedure are clearly defined. In terms of the qualification level, admission requirements meet at least the provisions laid down in the University Act 2002, Federal Law Gazette I 2002/120 as amended.

The admission requirements are clearly defined and meet the provisions laid down in the University Act 2002. The minimum requirements for being accepted in the study programme consist in short of the following: 1) a preliminary Bachelors degree, 2) high motivation assessed through a statement of purpose, and 3) fluency in English. In addition to this, relevant work experience is not required, but preferred.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP)

I. The private university provides the public with easily accessible information on the general conditions for student agreements which each student has to sign.

During the site visit CEU PU convincingly conveyed its intention to publish all legally required documents on the university's website (see also § 14 (9)).

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP)

m. Adequate support structures are available for students seeking advice on scientific, specialist, study-related organisational, or sociopsychological matters.

For all students, mentor groups are formed to support student learning processes. For the beginning phase of each programme, bridging courses help students whose previous specialisation may not have prepared them for all aspects of the programme, get to the required level. Students meet regularly with their teaching staff or mentors and can address department heads or programme coordinators in case of questions or complaints regarding their programme. An academic writing center with classes for students who need support (upon individual assessment) is provided at the beginning of each programme. Throughout the programme, students can schedule appointments for improving their writing style, e.g. when preparing course work.

The Student Life Center supports students in all extra-curricular and personal matters, from helping with visa, accommodation or insurance matters at the beginning of their programme to pastoral and psychological care during it (for further details see §14 (3) c). A career platform and service supports the search for internships (which are also often found through the help of academic staff contacts) or helps career entry, e.g. guidance for writing cover letters.

There is also a medical service for students, visa, opportunities for internship, help with cover letter, career platforms, career advisor.

With respect to financial needs, in addition to the financial aid provided in some form or another to a majority of students, there are flexible responses to students' funding needs that occur in the course of the programme, such as support for internships abroad, field research etc.. PhD candidates can spend time at partner universities with financial support from CEU as well as stipends for field research or travel money for presenting papers at conferences.

The support structures for advice on scientific, specialist, study-related organisational, or psychological matters are more than adequate. Hence the criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP)

n. If e-learning, blended learning and distance learning are part of the programme, suitable didactic, technical, organisational and financial preconditions have been created to ensure the achievement of the degree programme's qualification objectives.

According to the application documents and as confirmed at the site visit by the programme faculty, there is no need for suitable didactic, technical, organisational and financial preconditions for e-learning, blended learning and distance learning, as all teaching takes place at the premises of the university. Social media (e.g. Facebook group) are used for community exchange within the international joint master.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP)

p. The following additional criteria apply to the accreditation of joint degree programmes:

- *The partner institutions are recognised post-secondary educational institutions.*
- *The degree programme has been accredited, if so required, in accordance with the national laws and regulations applicable in the partner institutions' countries, or a parallel or joint accreditation procedure is underway.*
- *In a co-operation agreement the institutions involved have specified the following aspects as a minimum:*
 - *academic performance to be rendered by the students at the respective institutions;*
 - *admission and selection procedures;*
 - *determination of the applicable study and examination regulation(s);*
 - *automatic and full recognition of examinations and scientific papers produced at the institutions involved;*
 - *academic degree and specification of how and by whom academic degrees will be awarded;*
 - *organisational rules and administrative accountability.*

The Erasmus Mundus Masters Programme in Public Policy (Mundus MAPP) is a joint master programme in which four leading European universities joined forces to cooperate in public policy education within the framework of this Erasmus Mundus programme: Central European University - private university (coordinator of the consortium), Institut Barcelons d'Estudis Internacionals (IBEI), International Institute of Social Studies of Erasmus University Rotterdam (ISS), and the University of York. The partner universities delivering Mundus MAPP score in the top 100 globally in the Social Sciences (Times Higher Education World University Rankings).

Mundus MAPP has been running since 2007. The programme has been selected for an Erasmus+/Erasmus Mundus grant in competitive selection processes three times: in 2007, 2012 and 2018. The Erasmus Mundus label signals the highest academic quality for joint programmes within the EU.

While the Consortium agreement can only be revised after the institutional accreditation of CEU PU and the programme accreditation of Mundus MAPP, the partner universities have expressed in a signed letter their commitment to the continuation of the programme and are

ready to accept CEU PU as consortium partner as soon as the institution and the program are accredited.

The existing consortium agreement (incl. Annexes) specifies the following aspects, as confirmed during the site visit by the CEU PU program director of Mundus MAPP:

- Academic performance by the students at the respective institutions: which courses and how many credits students need to obtain within each track and the minimum passing grade (Annex 4);
- Admission: there is a joint admission procedure, through an online admission platform, in which the faculty of the two universities are involved representing the track to which the student applies. The admission decision is taken jointly (Annex 5).
- Study and exam regulations: there are program-wide study and exam regulations, as included also in the Programme Guide, detailing course/module grades, progression to year 2, duration of validity of assessments, termination, award requirements, merit and distinction, appeals and graduation ceremonies.
- Automatic and full recognition of examinations and scientific papers produced at the institutions involved (Annex 6);
- Diplomas: academic degree and specification of how and by whom academic degrees will be awarded (i.e. a joint degree + joint diplomacy supplement) (Annex 7);
- Organisational rules and administrative accountability (Annex 9, 10).

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

4.8 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (4): Research and development / advancement and appreciation of the arts

(4) Research and development / advancement and appreciation of the arts

a. *The private university has a research concept and/or a concept for the advancement and appreciation of the arts that is in line with its objectives and its profile.*

CEU PU defines itself as a research-intensive university and has a clear focus on reaching the top league of high quality research in the social sciences and humanities as well as in related fields like public policy, network science, data science and environmental sciences. As a research-intensive university CEU is committed to the freedom of research but equally cognisant of the importance to achieve results that will inform public discourse and policy and benefit society in other ways. In order to manage the always existing tension between bottom-up research initiatives coming from faculty and the overall positioning of the university in the wider research landscape that is the task of the university leadership, CEU is addressing both in an exemplary way. While actively supporting and encouraging faculty members in their bottom-up research activities, priority setting proceeds along the lines of building consistently on existing strengths. Examples are research on the future of democratic

societies and their inclusiveness and the challenges that come with climate change and further digitalization.

In its application CEU PU states that its "research agenda will continue the tradition of CEU-Budapest fostering both disciplinary, interdisciplinary and policy-relevant research, focused on the critical issues of the 21st century and rooted in the best traditions of Central European, European and American scholarship. CEU PU will be committed to the principles of freedom of research, which contributed to making CEU-Budapest one of the most successful universities in the region as evidenced by the QS World University Rankings by Subject 2019, being placed in the first 45 universities in the world in three areas, and in the first 100-200 in most other subject areas."

CEU PU also includes four proposed research projects in their application:

- PROJECT EXAMPLE 1: The Epistemology of the In/Human (Academic areas – stemming from the Humanities, the project covers the academic areas of: Epistemology, History & Philosophy of Science, Philosophy of the Social Sciences, and Political Philosophy)
- PROJECT EXAMPLE 2: Women's labour activism in Eastern Europe and transnationally, from the age of empires to the late 20th century (ZARAH) (Academic areas - Gender Studies, History)
- PROJECT EXAMPLE 3: The Micro-Dynamics of Problem-Solving Behavior (Academic areas – Network and Data Science, Social Psychology)
- PROJECT EXAMPLE 4: Constructing Social Minds: Coordination, Communication, and Cultural Transmission (Academic areas – Cognitive Science)

The ERASMUS MUNDUS programmes (MAPP, GEMMA, MESPOM) contribute to the research network of CEU. Given the wide range of topics, this brings in a large scope of different higher education institutions as co-operating partners for CEU PU.

CEU PU supports bottom-up initiatives of the researchers hired by the institution and offers seed funding and a well-staffed research-support office for grant applications and administration, replicating the one in CEU-Budapest which has proven to be very successful in the past. Per capita, CEU researchers have scored higher in ERC grants than any other institution in Europe in their subject areas. Researchers are also institutionally encouraged to collaborate among each other through intramural research funding.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

(4) Research and development / advancement and appreciation of the arts

b. *The envisaged research and/or advancement and appreciation of the arts complies with international methodical-scientific and/or artistic standards.*

The number of seventeen ERC grants received so far is an outstanding proof not only for complying with international standards but having reached the top of European scientific standards. The goal is to maintain a ratio of 1 ERC grant out of 10 faculty members.

Academic excellence is the highest principle that guides all research activities. It is actively monitored and assessed on a continuous basis. In addition to the high success rate in ERC grant applications, CEU has an impressive record of participating in EU cooperative research projects.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

(4) Research and development / advancement and appreciation of the arts

c. The interaction between research and/or advancement and appreciation of the arts and teaching is ensured.

As a research-intensive university CEU takes pride in the close links between teaching and research activities. Every faculty member is expected to teach at least one course based on his/her own research. Through seminars and other participatory teaching formats students are trained and getting actively involved with research activities. As many of these coordinating efforts take place at departmental level, lively communities have evolved that include faculty, Ph.D. and the other students. A number of initiatives have been put into place to facilitate interdisciplinary research and teaching. The most visible and successful of these initiatives is the Intellectual Themes Initiative that provides internal funding for research and teaching projects crossing disciplinary and departmental boundaries.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

(4) Research and development / advancement and appreciation of the arts

d. The envisaged organisational and structural framework conditions are sufficient and suitable to implement the research concept and/or the concept for the advancement and appreciation of the arts.

A range of incentives for faculty and a wide instrumentarium of administrative and financial support exists that actively encourage, accompany and support the faculty in their research activities. For instance, small internal grants enable feasibility studies to be carried out before embarking on submitting a major research proposal. Seed funding is available as well as a sabbatical granted to junior faculty to support them in reaching the research goals mandated for promotion. As fully paid Ph.D. students comprise one third of the student body, they form an important part of implementing the research concept. The organisational and structural framework conditions, including funding and administrative support, are far above the level of support one would find at other continental European universities. This creates a climate of lively research and teaching communities, in which collaborative efforts in research become the norm. This leads to a very high research performance which contributes significantly to the visibility of CEU in the social science and humanities landscape in Europe. The organisational and structural framework conditions match entirely the overall research concept and guarantee its successful implementation.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

4.9 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (5): Organisation of the private university and its services

(5) Organisation of the private university and its services

a. *The applicant institution is a legal entity based in Austria.*

The applicant institution is the legal entity "CEU GmbH", located at Kohlmarkt 8-10, 1010 Wien (Firmenbuchnummer FN502313x). The sole shareholder (Gesellschafter) of "CEU GmbH" is "Central European Academic gemeinnützige Privatstiftung" (FN495537g), also based in Austria. The "CEU GmbH" will be the legal entity for the CEU Private University (CEU PU) within the meaning of § 2 Abs 1 Z 1 PUG.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

(5) Organisation of the private university and its services

b. *The organisational structures and responsibilities of the private university regarding the institution's bodies, their appointment and duties, meet international standards as expressed particularly in sections 20 to 25 of the Universities' Act 2002 (Universitätsgesetz, UG), ensuring the autonomy of the universities, the freedom of science and its teaching, the freedom of artistic activity as well as the dissemination of the arts and their teaching.*

The organisation and management of CEU PU, as laid down in its provisional statutes, blends governance principles of leading US universities in an organisational setup (university council, rector, rectorate, senate) which complies with the Austrian University Act of 2002.

In particular, out of the nine members of the University Council, four members will be appointed by the CEU GmbH as the maintainer, four will be elected by the Senate and one additional member by the eight other members. The Senate will consist of either 6 or 12 members. Half of them will be elected by senior faculty and one sixth of them by junior faculty (both, senior and junior faculty, are defined by the Academic Staff Handbook, following best international practice). One member is elected by the administrative staff. The residual, i.e. either 1 or 3 members, will be nominated by the Student Union of CEU PU (the student representation will be set up according to the provisions of the SHSG). The Rector, chairing the Senate, and one other member of the Rectorate, namely the Provost, are members of the Senate too, but with no voting rights. The list of responsibilities of the Senate (e.g., establishment, modification, suspension and termination of degree and non-degree programs, preliminary approval of the strategic plan and mission statement, proposal of three candidates for the position of the Rector) emulates the list of responsibilities of senates in public universities in Austria.

The Senate, given its structure and responsibilities, will be a well institutionalised academic self-governing body. The strategic control of CEU PU is managed by the interplay among the Rector, Rectorate, University Council and Senate. The responsibilities of the Rector (resp. of the Rectorate) follow the relevant stipulations of the Austrian University Act of 2002. The election and dismissal of the Rector will be the responsibility of the Supervisory Board of the CEU GmbH, however the statutes provide a sufficient degree of participation of academic

bodies in the overall decision making, especially when electing the Rector (as already mentioned, the Rector will be picked out of proposal of three candidates made by the Senate, see Section II § 5 (2) of the statutes).

The criterion, as interpreted by the "Handreichung zur Auslegung des § 14 Abs 5 lit b PU-AkkVO: Organisationsstruktur an Privatuniversitäten" (Stand 13.12.2016), is **fulfilled**.

The panel would like to add the following **recommendation**: The provisional statutes stipulate among the responsibilities of the Supervisory Board of the CEU GmbH that this body "...decides ... on the strategic plan of the university ..." (Section II §1 (1)). However, among the responsibilities of the University Council, the statutes state that the University Council has the "... task: ... b) Adoption of the strategic plan ..." (Section II §2 (4)). Consequently, a positive competence conflict between these two bodies might emerge. One way of solving this conflict is to leave the adoption of the strategic plan to the University Council, thereby stressing the participation of academic bodies in the decision making within the university. As the Supervisory Board nominates 4 out of 9 members of the University Council, and as it will decide on the budget anyhow, it may exert its influence on the making of the strategic plan via nominations to the University Council and by deciding on financial matters of the CEU PU.

(5) Organisation of the private university and its services

c.The organisational structure and the responsibilities of the private university have been laid down in a statute, which has been made easily accessible to the public and governs the following aspects as a minimum:

- the guiding principles and tasks of the institution;*
- the institution's bodies, their appointment and tasks;*
- staff categories and set designations for scientific staff;*
- gender equality and the advancement of women;*
- student co-determination in academic matters;*
- regulations governing the degree programmes, in particular admission and examination regulations as well as the heads of studies;*
- guidelines for academic honours (if applicable);*
- guidelines for the appointment of professors and the awarding of habilitation degrees (if applicable).*

In Section I §2, the statutes explicitly state guiding principles and tasks of the institution as "a world-class international and multi-cultural university committed to academic excellence and offering a transformative education with global impact". The statutes contain specific provisions for the organisational structure of the university, how the various bodies are formed and how administrative heads are appointed. All is well-structured and follows the principles of the Austrian University Act/Universitätsgesetz 2002.

On specific issues:

(1) Staff categories and guidelines for the appointment of professors

The general rules and structure of the academic staff is laid down in a well elaborated document, the so called *Academic Staff Handbook* (with annexes 56 pages long). It follows the best practice of leading US universities.

Accordingly, the hiring of academic staff positions follows a multi-stage process: approval of an open position (post), public announcement of the post, installation of a search committee (resembling the Berufungskommission at Austrian public universities), selection procedures in order to arrive at a recommendation of a shortlist by the search committee to the Provost and, ultimately, to the Rector, job offers, and mentoring of new hires. For instructors, lecturers and senior lecturers, there are simplified hiring procedures.

As it is the common practice at US universities, all resident academic staff members are evaluated annually. The evaluation of academic performance is divided into three categories: research, teaching, and service to the University and to the larger academic community. A "Re-appointment and Promotion Committee", chaired by the Provost and with five additional members appointed by the Senate, reviews all cases and advises the Provost who then formulates a recommendation which will be forwarded to the Rector, who has the final decision. In the case of a re-appointment and promotion of assistant professors or associate research fellows, the procedures follow the principles of the so called tenure track system at leading US universities. Since the tenure track system has recently been fully implemented in the Austrian University Act, see §99 UG2002 igF, the appointment of the academic staff is in line with hiring and promotion procedures at Austrian public universities.

(2) Gender equality and the advancement of women

The CEU Equal Opportunity Policy is an appendix to the university's statutes and ensures that CEU PU provides an inclusive and supporting environment on various levels to its staff, faculty, (prospective, current and former) students and various other groups in contact with the university. The policy contains amongst other aspects definitions of discrimination, harassment and protected grounds, specifications on how to enforce the principle of equal opportunity in employment, education and training and it clarifies responsibilities and duties of relevant persons and bodies (such as the Senate Equal Opportunity Committee [SeCur] or the Senate Disciplinary Committee and Senate Grievance Committee) in this matter. (For further information about gender quality and the advancement of women see §14 (2) lit c)

(3) Student co-determination in academic matters

The statutes ensure student co-determination in academic matters. Students are represented in the Senate and various other bodies and committees of the university. In accordance with the PU-AkkVO, the university has statutes in which student co-determination in academic matters is regulated. Furthermore, the statutes contain a section on student representation, in which it is laid down that the student representatives are elected in the accordance with the provisions of the Austrian Student Union ("ÖH") and the Student Union Act. Although it is clearly visible that CEU PU aims to comply with the existing legal regulations, the specifications on the CEU PU Student Union election and constitution deviates to some extent from the legal provisions. The passage on the tasks and competences neglects the far more extensive tasks and competences laid down in the Student Union Act.

As CEU PU definitely ensures student co-determination in academic matters and intends to comply with the Student Union Act (HSG), and as the HSG is mandatory law, the criterion can be regarded as **fulfilled**.

Recommendation:

The panel recommends CEU PU to adapt this section in its statutes, so that legal compliance is clearly given. To achieve this, it would be enough to only maintain the first sentence of the section referring to the legal basis of the student representation (since everything else is regulated in detail therein) and note the active involvement of students in academic matters at CEU PU.

(5) Organisation of the private university and its services

d. If the private university intends to offer degree programmes mostly or entirely at a location different from the main site and/or the accredited sites, it shall ensure - in addition to meeting the criteria under sections 14 and 17 - that

- the accountability and the responsibilities of the main institution and the other sites have been clearly defined and are adequate;*
- organisation, management and support structures are established in the same quality as they are maintained at the other accredited sites;*
- degree programmes which are offered at several sites are of uniform quality;*
- offering degree programmes at an additional site does not lead to a lack of resources and, subsequently, a deterioration in quality at existing sites;*
- all sites are included in the institution's quality management system;*

NOT RELEVANT

(5) Organisation of the private university and its services

e. If the private university intends to offer degree programmes abroad, it shall ensure - in addition to meeting the criteria under sections 14 and 17 - that the respective national legislation is observed and educational traditions and cultural differences regarding teaching and learning, including examinations, are respected - only if and insofar this would not affect the university of applied sciences' quality standards. and in particular with regard to the student's role in the teaching and learning process as well as in any quality assurance processes.

NOT RELEVANT

(5) Organisation of the private university and its services

f. The private university has a sufficient number of scientific and non-scientific staff.

CEU PU will gradually increase its scientific and non-scientific staff. In all phases of expansion there will be a student/staff ratio of at least 10/1, in fact approaching a 7/1 student/staff ratio (650 BA and MA students over 120 FTE academic staff with 200 support staff in the first year 2020/21, up to 7.5/1 of 1280 BA and MA students /180 FTE academic staff in 2024/25). CEU PU will thus be more than sufficiently staffed, thus **fulfilling** the criterion.

It should be noted that the faculty–student ratio at CEU PU as well as the ratio of non-scientific staff either to faculty or student numbers are far superior to the corresponding ratios at Austrian public universities.

(5) Organisation of the private university and its services

g. The scientific and/or artistic staff has the necessary pertinent and didactic qualifications.

The scientific staff employed by the University has more than the necessary research and didactic qualifications expected from an institution of this kind. Permanent members of academic staff whose resumes have been provided are very experienced and well-qualified lecturers and researchers who in most cases have taught before at other prestigious institutions or hold academic degrees (PhD) from such institutions (e.g. Cambridge University, LSE, University of Pittsburgh). Most of them have taught courses and modules before that are relevant for their current employment and the mission of CEU PU. Members of academic staff have also excellent research experience and publications record, and many of them have been successful at acquiring European research grants including ERC and Horizon 2020 grants. The faculty CVs that have been submitted as an appendix to this accreditation application show rich evidence of pertinent research and teaching qualifications in all cases.

As mentioned under § 14 (5) c, academic staff members will be evaluated with respect to their teaching. The CEU Budapest has excelled in its teaching performance. One can therefore expect that this excellent performance will continue at CEU PU.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

(5) Organisation of the private university and its services

h. Scientific and/or artistic staff in permanent employment shall teach at least 50% of the classes. Staff in permanent employment shall mean those persons who have a contractual relationship with the private university that covers at least 50% of their working hours in salaried employment.

The University has provided copies of provisional contracts with nineteen permanent members of academic staff who will teach more than 50% of the classes. These contracts cover 100% of their working hours in salaried employment with CEU.

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

(5) Organisation of the private university and its services

i. The scientific and/or artistic staff for each combination of bachelor and/or master degree programmes consists of at least one permanent employee who possesses the required pertinent qualifications to be appointed professor, as well as one full time equivalent allocated to a maximum of three persons with at least a doctoral degree or artistic credentials, without prejudice to the provisions of section 14 para. 5 subpara. h.

According to the application documents, CEU will employ more than one permanent member of academic staff who will be appointed professor for each bachelor and master programmes, including heads of programmes who possess all required qualifications and will be appointed professors. CEU will employ more than one full time member of academic staff with at least a doctoral degree.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

(5) Organisation of the private university and its services

k. The integration of non-permanent scientific and/or artistic staff in teaching and programme organisation is ensured.

The non-permanent staff at CEU-Budapest has been limited to visiting research or teaching faculty who are integrated into university life through colloquia where they present their work and cooperative projects with colleagues. The same practice will be applied to CEU PU in Vienna.

The criterion is thus **fulfilled**.

(5) Organisation of the private university and its services

I. The ratio of permanent scientific/artistic staff to students is adequate.

The permanent staff-student ratios will be superior to the corresponding ratios at Austrian public universities:

In all phases of expansion there will be a student/staff ratio of at least 10/1, in fact approaching a 7/1 student/staff ratio (650 BA and MA students over 120 FTE academic staff with 200 support staff in the first year 2020/21, up to 7.5/1 of 1280 BA and MA students /180 FTE academic staff in 2024/25). CEU PU will thus be more than sufficiently staffed, thus fulfilling the criterion.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

(5) Organisation of the private university and its services

m. A transparent, university-relevant and quality-driven recruitment procedure is in place for hiring teaching and research staff.

According to the general rules laid down in the *Academic Staff Handbook*, the hiring of academic staff positions follows a multi-stage process: approval of an open position (post), public announcement of the post, installation of a search committee (resembling the Berufungskommission at Austrian public universities), selection procedures in order to arrive at a recommendation of a shortlist by the search committee to the Provost and, ultimately, to the Rector, job offers, and mentoring of new hires. For instructors, lecturers and senior lecturers, there are simplified hiring procedures.

As it is the common practice at US universities, all resident academic staff members are evaluated annually. The evaluation of academic performance is divided into three categories: research, teaching, and service to the University and to the larger academic community. A "Re-appointment and Promotion Committee", chaired by the Provost and with five additional members appointed by the Senate, reviews all cases and advises the Provost who then formulates a recommendation which will be forwarded to the Rector, who has the final decision.

In the case of a re-appointment and promotion of assistant professors or associate research fellows, the procedures follow the principles of the so called tenure track system at leading US universities. Since the tenure track system has recently been fully implemented in the Austrian University Act, see § 99 UG, the appointment of the academic staff is in line with hiring and promotion procedures at Austrian public universities.

Hence, transparent, university-relevant and quality driven hiring procedures for the academic staff will be implemented.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

(5) Organisation of the private university and its services

n. The procedure to be appointed professor has been laid down in an appointment code and is modelled on international standards as mentioned, for example, in the University Act 2002, Federal Law Gazette I 2002/120 as amended. In the event that the number of professors at a given institution is not sufficient to fill the positions on the appointment committee, external professors shall be appointed members of the appointment committee until the number of professors is sufficient.

The appointment of professors at CEU PU will be equivalent to § 98 UG 2002 when hiring new professors or equivalent to § 99 UG 2002 when promoting staff to the rank of professor. See above under § 14 (5) c, remark (1), second and third paragraph.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

(5) Organisation of the private university and its services

o. The private university provides for adequate further training and staff development measures.

There is a staff development programme in place in Budapest which will be conducted in the same manner in Vienna. This includes annual development goals and meetings with staff in which an annual training plan for non-academic staff members is developed to respond to current and imminent challenges. These include stress management, intercultural management, and conflict management, as well as IT and technical skills to support use and analysis of data. To facilitate the transfer to Vienna, new programs will be added to address concrete challenges of the transfer. For new heads of departments and faculty who enter supervisory positions, training workshops are provided. There is a new onboarding process for new staff.

For academic staff, there are annual self-evaluations which are discussed with the head of department to ensure continuous and transparent communication on meeting quality standards for promotion and developing relevant competences. An early sabbatical within the first three years allows young staff to develop their research profile further.

The criterion is thus **fulfilled**.

(5) Organisation of the private university and its services

p. The following requirements need to be met for the institution to be entitled to grant authorisation to teach (venia docendi):

- With respect to habilitation, a well-established research environment is in place at the institution in the relevant discipline. As a rule, this requires the institution to be authorised to confer relevant doctoral degrees.*
- The private university specifies the qualifications required to be granted authorisation to teach as well as the procedure in a habilitation regulation, which is in line with section 103 University Act 2002 mutatis mutandis.*

NOT RELEVANT

4.10 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (6): Funding and resources

(6) Funding and resources

a. The private university has a financial plan which outlines the funding for at least six years, transparently documenting the funding sources.

CEU PU has presented a six-year financial plan with revenues and total operating expenses for the academic years 2019/20 up to 2024/25. Total operating expenses will quickly increase to [...] in 2021/22 and slightly grow thereafter to [...] in 2024/25. Sizable annual revenues, up to [...] in 2024/25, will come from the [...] and from annual grants by [...]. Most of the other revenues will be generated by charging tuition fees [...], by fundraising [...], and by overhead

contributions from externally funded research projects. In each year, total revenues exceed total operating expenses.

The [...] is a foundation which has been based in The Netherlands in order to protect it from political attacks. It has a net asset position of around [...]. The use of these means is now dedicated to funding the operations of CEU Budapest campus and will be opened for financing the activities of CEU PU in Vienna.

There is a letter dated January 14, 2019, by [...] to the Rector of CEU (CEU PU) which indicates the total amount of support of [...] to CEU PU for the coming six years. In this grant an amount of [...] is included for the move of CEU to Vienna.

The funding of CEU PU, at least up to 2024/25, is fully secured.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

(6) Funding and resources

b. The private university has enough facilities and equipment to adequately meet the requirements of the degree programmes and/or research activities.

CEU is aware of the issue of remaining competitive in hiring staff in Vienna. Hence, CEU has done benchmarking for faculty and non-academic staff (Deloitte). By large, faculty in Austria is relatively competitive internationally, but as CEU already pays competitive salaries for faculty in Budapest no extra costs are expected. Things are more difficult for non-academic staff since salaries vary more in Austria than they did/do in Hungary. Eventually, it is the plan that faculty/staff will be resident in Austria. For a certain period, people will commute. However, CEU does not want to be a commuting university.

CEU PU will rent a building formerly used by an Austrian bank. There is a rental contract which provides sufficient space for the operations of CEU PU. Around 20.000 m² will be available in a modern office building in Quellenstraße 51-55, 1100 Vienna, near the Central Station. This building is currently being refurbished. The 20,000 square meters will comprise 35 seminar rooms, single and shared offices (average space allocation 8m²), library (between 200 and 250 spaces), auditorium for about 200 for public lectures, private offices bookable for teaching/research faculty, co-Labs for group work, student hubs, 5 computer labs, 10 PhD labs. EdTech solutions, smart teaching and learning will be developed across campus. "Smart classroom" solutions. The CEU PU will invest in providing an infrastructure there which, given the focus of CEU PU on social sciences and the humanities, will outperform the average investment amount per square meter by public universities in Vienna.

The premises will finally serve about 1,800 students and 800 faculty/staff. Cost to re-fit the premises are [...]. Two phases: first three floors for September 2019, remaining two floors in September 2020.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

(6) Funding and resources

c. Proof is available that the private university is authorised to use the facilities and equipment.

For the premises at Quellenstraße 51–55, 1100 Wien-Favoriten, which will serve as interim home for the university, the applicant presents a signed subrental agreement. Agreement lasts from 2019 until 2025.

The rental contract is signed between BAWAG P.S.K. as lessor and CEU GmbH as Lessee. BAWAG P.S.K. confirmed this rental contract in a letter to AQ Austria (dated April 2, 2019).

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

4.11 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (7): National and international co-operation

(7) National and international co-operation

a. In line with its profile, the private university enters into co-operation projects with partners inside and, if applicable, outside the higher education sector.

CEU defines itself as a global university with a strong local civic commitment. The strong international orientation is manifest in the composition of the student and faculty body - students come from 110 countries and faculty from 40 countries – which brings with it an extraordinary global reach and major challenges for a European university. This strong international commitment is reflected in the educational and in the research programmes, the latter having a strong comparative dimension. Both teaching and research in an international context necessitate participation in a wide range of international networks and partnerships. Given the relatively small size of the university, networks are essential in order to exchange actively with other top universities in Europe, the US and elsewhere.

The international partnerships forged by CEU are highly appreciated by the students and provide a strong motivation to come to CEU. International study programmes offer a broad range of choices of educational experience and immersion in different intellectual and cultural environments. They allow to work with fellow students coming from different backgrounds and enhance the value of diversity for everybody. International study programmes also enable greater flexibility of choice for students to combine courses of interest for them in a way that meets their intellectual needs and requirements. The mobility these partnerships offer for students and faculty is a definite asset offered by CEU and contributes greatly to its attractiveness. On the research side all international partnerships and cooperations are based on the exchange and mobility of faculty and students and thus contribute greatly to the exchange of ideas and brain circulation.

Probably the most important international cooperation network is the participation in the various ERASMUS and Erasmus Mundus programmes.

CEU has already a number of joint-degree programs on the Master level and plans further agreements, e.g. a Master programme with the Inter-University Institute in Florence. Joint

degrees come with an inherent quality assessment as students are able to compare. In addition, the strong focus on full integration of students is a great advantage.

CEU is part of the recent initiative by the European Commission to form a European university network constituted as a European university. CIVICA brings together CEU with Bocconi, Milano; EUI, Firenze; the Hertie School, Berlin; and SciencePo, Paris. The decision on the outcome of the competition will soon be made, but independently of funding from the EU, the consortium plans to work closely together over the coming years. CEU has assumed the coordination of the research component in the consortium.

Another long standing and much appreciated collaboration exists with Bard College, New York that opens its international Bard College network around the world to CEU, offering participation with student and faculty exchange on a global level.

New academic partnerships in research and education with top quality academic institutions are planned within the European Higher Education Area and the European Research Area. CEU PU will also become a member of the European University Network and it is foreseen that CEU PU will join existing joint Erasmus mundi Master's Degree Programmes as CEU-Budapest did before.

National co-operation with Austrian partners inside and outside of the HE sector will build on already existing ones, like cooperation links with the University of Vienna, the Austrian Academy of Science, the Institut für die Wissenschaft vom Menschen, the Vienna Institute for International Economic Studies, and others; as well as with the University of Graz, Donau Universität Krems and University of Salzburg. Special mention should be made of the excellent and close collaboration that exists already between the Department of Network and Data Science and the Complexity Science Hub Vienna.

Outside the academic sector partnerships with the Kunsthistorische Museum, the EU Agency for Fundamental Rights, the Filmarchiv, IIASA in Laxenburg and other institutions in Austria will also be deepened further and expanded beyond already existing links.

In line with the mission of CEU and the strong civic engagement it has demonstrated in Budapest, a similar strong engagement with local communities outside of the HE sector are planned for Vienna. Beginning in the immediate neighbourhood of CEU in the 10th district of Vienna, outreach projects with local communities, an open door policy, e.g. for using the library, and other forms of civic engagement are planned.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

(7) National and international co-operation

b. The private university takes adequate measures to support the mobility of students and staff.

All of the already existing international and national partnerships are based on the mobility of students and staff and adequate measures of support are in place, both in financial and in organisational terms as shown in the various study and research programs. The existing measures cover a broad range from visa issues to accomodation, and from academic guidance and mentoring to practical concerns. There are also special policies in place to encourage and

facilitate internships of students in various locations as well as financial support for attending conferences and similar items falling under mobility.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

4.12 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (8): Quality management system

(8) Quality management system

a. *At the private university, a quality management system is in place which ensures the regular quality assessment of the core responsibilities and fosters their advancement.*

With respect to quality management, a wide array of information was provided both in the documents and in the interviews.

The *Institutional Assessment and Quality Assurance (IAQA) Policy* is part of the statutes of CEU PU. It covers QA on a institutional level and with regard to academic units, teaching programs, research centers, academic support units and non-academic units. The *Mandate of the Senate Curriculum and Academic Quality Assurance Committee (SECUR)*, the *Procedure for Strategic Reviews of Academic Units at CEU PU*, and *Guidelines and Checklist for Annual Reviews* are part of this policy.

In this policy CEU PU defines the following principles for QA:

- Centrality of the University's mission and strategic goals as defined in its strategic documents.
- Involvement and ownership by faculty and staff. IAQA processes are designed and implemented with direct involvement of CEU PU faculty and staff in such a way that they support and benefit their regular activities;
- Link to planning and continuous improvement. IAQA processes are part of the overall planning cycle. Each planning and assessment cycle should result in improvement of existing processes, practices, and outcomes.
- Differentiated, multi-level and systematic approach. Distinct IAQA processes take place in individual units, programs and at the institutional level. At the same time, the whole IAQA system at CEU PU is organized and managed in a coherent and systematic way so that processes at different units and levels inform and support each other.

In addition, CEU PU has an antiplagiarism policy in place. The university sensitise students for these issues in the beginning of each programme, before submission of written assignments, and in the academic writing courses.

Since the policy is part of the statutes the final responsibility rests with the Senate hence the highest academic governance body of CEU PU.

The handbook provided in the application covers the entire (university-wide) QA system with clear description of quality assurance processes and responsibilities. Overall, academic quality is overseen by the Senate Curriculum and Academic Quality Assurance Committee, which annually evaluates all regular evaluations: "The Senate Curriculum and Academic Quality

Assurance Committee advises the Provost, the Rector, and the Senate on university-wide curriculum and other academic quality matters.”

Students are urged and frequently reminded to submit evaluation forms after each course. After grade submission, the results are revealed to the teaching staff and thereafter discussed between him or her and the department head. Concrete proposals for improvements by students are being discussed with teachers directly, in townhall meetings, or in discussions between the student union board and central administration.

The research quality and performance of all non-tenured academic staff, which is evaluated annually, is further supported through time resources (limited teaching load, half-year sabbaticals every three years), seed funds and research grant submission support. Individual performance is also discussed in annual review meetings with the department heads.

All departments are regularly (every 6 years) submitted to a strategic review which provides a qualitative assessment of the research and teaching offer, performance and perspectives in an auto-evaluation and external peer-review.

The support services are also being regularly reviewed, as are the quality and qualification development goals of its staff, so as to allow adaptation to new challenges and qualification demands.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

(8) Quality management system

b. The structures and procedures of the quality management system have been defined and documented and ensure the participation of full-time and part-time teachers, students, external experts and other relevant stakeholders. The most essential points of the quality management system have been made easily accessible to the public.

The above-mentioned policy is made available to all members of the university in the quality handbook and is published – together with all other quality-relevant policies e.g. regarding hiring procedures, equal opportunity, or curriculum development – via the internal communication platforms. An *Academic Staff Handbook* also gives information on all aspects of academic life, rights and duties, incl. with respect to quality procedures.

Students are informed about quality standards, quality assurance management, as well as their rights, duties and roles in the document *Student Rights, Rules and Academic Regulations* as well as in programme student guides.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

(8) Quality management system

c. The private university ensures that it gathers information that is relevant to a high-quality execution of its core responsibilities, analyses this information and incorporates it into quality-enhancing measures.

CEU is monitoring student performance, grade distribution, graduate success and alumni careers in order to get a better understanding of learning and career paths, consistency of quality standards and qualification profile development.

Unit heads have to annually report to the pro-rector focusing on the appointment and promoting process within the tenure track system of career progression. After the first five years, either contracts are prolonged or the applicant is promoted to associate professor directly. Assistant professors whose performance is not up the quality expectations are warned early on so that they may improve or look for alternative career options. In order to be promoted, applicants do not only have to show excellence in research but also need a qualified teaching portfolio and positive teaching evaluations. If teaching evaluations are too poor for promotion, applicants are encouraged to participate in workshops or other measurements concerning didactics, teaching methods.

Ten years ago, CEU implemented an online evaluation system. Only after 80% of the students have responded to the evaluation, the grades are made available. (However, after a certain period, grades have to be available regardless of the return rate.) Results are forwarded to the faculty member and the department head. Teaching evaluations have to be discussed within the yearly staff interviews. CEU compares evaluation results on all different levels of the university.

Gender equality is also monitored at all levels. Gender equality performance and improvements are also studied as part of a European cooperative institutional research project with other universities.

All institutional data is gathered and analysed by an institutional research service which also explores benchmarks with other institutions. The Vice President for student enrollment also monitors institutional benchmarks for market research to improve institutional practices and marketing.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

4.13 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 (9): Information

(9) Information

The private university provides the public with easily accessible and accurate information on its services and its degree programmes.

CEU PU intends to provide the public with information on its services, degree programs, as well as other relevant university-related areas through their website. For that purpose the domains ceu.at and ceu.ac.at have been secured and will launch after the successful accreditation of CEU PU. In the course of the site visit, CPU PU underlined their intention of

publishing all information needed to fulfill legal requirements and to establish a high degree of transparency about the institution.

Viewing the already existing website of CEU (ceu.edu), which contains a wide spectrum of relevant information (i.e. about the programs currently offered in Hungary, university policies, services provided, research, etc.), the members of the expert panel are left with no doubt that CEU will continue this practice after its transition to Vienna.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

5 Summary and final assessment

Upon review of all submitted documents and in-depth discussions with the applicant institution's representatives considering all open questions on all dimensions of institutional and programme objectives, development plans and measures, quality standards and procedures, regulations and guidelines, the panel is convinced that it has received more than sufficient information on all aspects pertaining to the accreditation criteria.

It should also be noted that among all interviewed CEU staff, from institutional leadership, department heads, heads of support services leaders to faculty and students, the readiness and ability to offer an in-depth insight into institutional processes was remarkable and the information provided detailed and well-reflected. The panel was able to witness a quality awareness and culture among institutional representatives that seemed to be deep-rooted and was reflected in transparent clear guidelines on institutional quality standards, processes, and responsibilities. Most remarkably, the panel was struck by the openness to continuous improvement and the widespread academic entrepreneurship with which the institutional leadership and faculty approached the move to Vienna, transforming the originally politically imposed regulatory constraint into an academic and institutional opportunity. The enthusiasm and intellectual investment into the design of new bachelor-level programs and the identification of new cooperation possibilities in research and teaching with Viennese universities reflected not only remarkable institutional resilience and agility but also a search for continuous improvement.

To conclude, the panel accreditation finds, on the basis of all written evidence and site visit discussions, that CEU PU meets all institutional accreditation criteria and that the 6 programs it submitted for accreditation meet all programme and institutional criteria fully. It therefore strongly recommends that the new CEU PU and the 2 Bachelor programs CPS and PPE as well as the 4 Master programs GEMMA, IPA, MAPP and MESPOM be accredited.

Moreover, the panel firmly believes that the new institution CEU PU will be a stimulating enrichment for the Austrian higher Education landscape, both in its academic research and educational offer as well as in its institutional good practices.

6 Reviewed documents

- Application (in the version of 17 April 2019) including annexes
- Additional application documents: signed co-operation addenda (20 May 2019)
- Additional application documents: quality report, strategic review (submitted 29 May 2019)
- Documents provided during site visit (programme handbook MAAP, BOOST brochure)
- Adapted documents provided after site visit: Diploma Supplement, Study Regulations, co-operation agreement MAPP (11 June 2019)

7 Confirmation of the experts

REMOVED FOR PUBLISHING

REMOVED FOR PUBLISHING

8 Annex 1: review report to GEMMA

8.1 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 17 (1) a-p: Degree programme and degree programme management – Master of Arts in “Women’s and Gender Studies” (GEMMA)

Degree programme and degree programme management (GEMMA)

a. The degree programme is aligned with the objectives of the institution and is logically connected with the plan for its development.

CEU is existing partner to the Erasmus Mundus Master’s Degree programme Women’s and Gender Studies that has been running since 2006 and was also recently approved by the European Commission as an EMJMD. The programme is strongly aligned with the core mission and objectives of CEU PU whose partnership to the programme can logically be integrated into the CEU PU environment and development plan. The programme is highly international and culturally diverse, both in terms of its content, staff and student-make-up. Critical inquiry, interdisciplinary teaching and learning, world class research and community engagement are core values of CEU PU, which are reflected in the field of women’s and gender studies and the GEMMA programme specifically. The programme has a strong commitment to the analysis and the struggle against inequalities and injustices on the basis of differences, this is also aligned with the mission and strategic goals of CEU PU that include an interest in addressing contemporary pressing societal issues; support for open societies and democracy; and a strong opposition to all forms of discrimination on the basis of socially and morally responsibly intellectual inquiry and solid academic research and education. Graduates in women’s and gender studies are educated as critical thinkers who are able to recognize, analyse and tackle discrimination and inequality in society.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (GEMMA)

b. The qualification objectives of the degree programme (learning outcomes of the degree programme) have been clearly defined and meet the scientific and professional requirements and are in accordance with the respective levels of the qualification framework of the European Higher Education Area.

GEMMA is an Erasmus Mundus Master’s Degree involving seven European higher education institutions that has been running since 2006 and was also recently approved by the European Commission as an EMJMD (2017). It meets the qualification framework of the European Higher Education Area in its requirements for a second cycle qualification of 120 ECTS in a two-year programme. According to the programme profile, graduates of the GEMMA programme demonstrate understandings, skills and competences in fields, themes and theories in interdisciplinary gender studies and related scholarly fields; methods in interdisciplinary gender studies in social sciences and humanities; the deployment of gender concepts, theories and methods in other areas; principles of professional ethics; and in-depth

knowledge of a chosen area of studies across the area of women's and gender studies. Apart from the inclusion of communication skills to a specialist and non-specialist audience, the qualification objectives or learning objectives of the degree programme are generally clearly defined and meet scientific, professional and level requirements of the EHEA.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (GEMMA)

c. The name of the degree programme corresponds to the qualification profile.

The GEMMA programme entitled 'Master of Arts in Women's and Gender Studies' aptly corresponds to the qualification profile. As an interdisciplinary master situated in the social sciences and humanities, the qualification of 'Master of Arts' is fully applicable. The programme carries a double title that conjoins the fields of women's studies and gender studies. Although the learning outcomes appear to be mostly geared to the field of 'gender studies' as an umbrella term in order to be inclusive of the growing divergence in gender-related research into arguably distinct disciplines or fields, such as women's studies, men's studies, but also queer studies, race studies, etc., it also aptly emphasizes the centrality of the study of 'women' as a central category in the title. When reviewing the programme application, this can be justified by some of its central features. Firstly, the programme emphasizes the centrality of feminist theory and the feminist movement. Feminism features in the brief description of the programme, where it is stated that the programme is unique in "bringing together approaches to feminism from all cardinal points in Europe". Women as a category is central to feminism and feminist theory, and its inclusion in the title balances the argument that could possibly be raised that 'gender studies' does not necessarily take 'women' nor the 'status of women in society' as a central object of inquiry. Furthermore, the core courses to the programme are presented as all in the same main areas of feminist research in the consortium universities: (Feminist History; Feminist Theory; Feminist Methodology). Secondly, when reviewing the full programme, including elective courses at the different partner institutions, the diversity of traditions within fields of gender/women's studies and across institutional programmes becomes apparent. Whereas some courses are profiled as geared to 'women's studies' (at least as is apparent from course titles), e.g., Bologna, York, others more to gender, gender and women, and/or other forms of difference and inequality, such as intersectionality, race, sexuality, postcolonialism (CEU, Lodz, Granada, Oviedo, Utrecht). These elements justify and capture well the combined title of the programme in its communication to (potential) students, the international academic community and society at large.

The name of the degree programme therefore fully corresponds to the qualification profile and this criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (GEMMA)

d. The students are involved in an appropriate manner in shaping the teaching and learning processes. They are encouraged to be actively involved in the learning process.

*Analogous to the other Master programmes § 17 (1) d, the criterion is regarded as **fulfilled**. See above: Degree programme and degree programme management (MAPP).*

Degree programme and degree programme management (GEMMA)

e. The contents, structure and scope of and the teaching method applied to the curriculum and the modules meet the scientific and professional requirements and are suited to achieve the intended learning outcomes. They furthermore take into account the requirements of a diversified student body.

This interdisciplinary programme that uniquely involves seven European institutions in co-operation with American partners and their specific educational traditions, brings together a varied yet at the same time focused range of expertise in the diversified field of women's and gender studies that could not be achieved by any single institution on its own. The contents of the programme have an emphasis on feminist approaches to multiple forms of difference and inequality with gender and women as a starting point (as exemplified in the compulsory core modules for all), but not ending point in the curriculum. This scope reflects the current status of women's and gender studies research and education in the scholarly community at a high international level. The two-year programme is also clearly and efficiently structured as to allow for maximal focus for the student to achieve the shared learning outcomes, but by nature of the combination of compulsory modules and elective modules over two partner institutions of choice, it also allows for a high degree of flexibility for the student to achieve scholarly and/or professional competences in a particular discipline, cluster, field or theme of choice, depending on the choice of institution.

The contents, structure and scope of the curriculum and the modules of the GEMMA programme meet the scientific and professional requirements.

With regards to teaching methods, the programme application does not present a shared list of teaching methods; nor a general teaching methodology or philosophy. Teaching methods can nevertheless be deduced from the outlines of modules, including for example the core modules. The feminist theory core module in its learning outcomes emphasizes the 'practice of creative thinking through transdisciplinary conversations'. It also aspires to 'improve analytical, writing, and presentation skills through reading, writing reaction papers, class presentations, and group presentations.' The feminist methodology module emphasizes offering students 'tools for conducting research'. However, all separate course offerings, per institution, do specifically list teaching methods. To name but a few, these include lectures, active class participation, seminar discussions of readings, essays, exercises, student presentations, archive analysis, visual analysis, interviews, reaction papers, research papers, using online learning platforms, peer reviewing, portfolios, workshops, etc. Seeing the small number of students that are yearly anticipated to enrol in the programme (for CEU PU 10 students), and depending on the number of students from other programmes attending the same courses, it is assumed that in practice these teaching methods can effectively be applied and contribute to participatory and active learning.

Next to more traditional lectures and forms of learning and assessment (oral and written exams), the teaching methods are varied and very much geared to class attendance and participatory learning and therefore meet the scientific and professional requirements of the course learning outcomes. They are also suited to achieve the intended learning outcomes of the programme in its whole, such as acquiring understandings, competences and skills in knowledge, theories, methods, and the applications of these in the field of interdisciplinary women's and gender studies.

The programme application does not explicitly discuss how it deals, or aims to deal, with the lived diversity among its student population. In reference to CEU PU it does refer to its alignment with the mission and strategic goals of CEU PU which include a strong opposition to all forms of discrimination and a distinctive educational programme which builds on, among others, the international diversity of its faculty and students. Seeing the objectives and content of the programme as a whole, it is inferred that an ethos of anti-discrimination and a strong commitment to the analysis and the struggle against inequalities and injustices on the basis of differences (including gender, sexuality, ethnicity, disability, etc), undergirds attention and support to diversity among students and the challenges this might bring to the classroom. This challenge is exacerbated (and of course simultaneously enriched) by the international diversity among staff and students, and in the interaction between staff and students, and among students themselves seeing the international and mobile character of the programme.

Taken together, the criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (GEMMA)

f. The academic degree to be awarded is comparable on an international scale.

GEMMA awards the degree of 'Master of Arts in Women's and Gender Studies'. The degree is comparable on an international scale with kindred academic degrees in the field of women's and gender studies, both on offer at some of partner institutions themselves and institutions across the globe outside of the consortium. (see e.g. Reference Points for the Design and Delivery of Degree Programmes in Gender Studies, http://tuningacademy.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/02/RefGender-Studies_EU_EN.pdf).

According to the cooperation agreement (7 July 2017) for the granting of a double master's degree in women's and gender studies, programme students receive two second cycle degrees according to the two Programme country institution chose (Home and Mobility). Each of the two degrees is accompanied by a diploma supplement and an additional certificate. For CEU this is "Master of Arts in Gender Studies, GEMMA: Women's and Gender Studies specialisation".

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (GEMMA)

g. The application of the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS) is adequate and plausible.

The two-year programme consists of 120 ECTS which complies with the requirements for the second cycle according to the framework for qualifications in the EHEA (between 60-120 ECTS). 30 ECTS can be attained per term, with 60 ECTS to be completed in the first year at the Home University and organized around three core modules: Feminist History; Feminist Theory and Feminist Methodology. All students have to earn 10 ECTS in each of these modules as a general requirement for the programme. Beyond that, they need to earn 30 ECTS of elective credits from the Elective Courses Module, according to students' interests.

As the first year can be completed in seven different institutions, there is a variety in ECTS allocation and distribution within the modules and across course electives, ranging between 2, 4, 8, for CEU PU in the first year as home institution, allowing for a combination which varies between 28 and 32 ECTS per term in order to attain 60 ECTS in the first year. There is similarly a range of ECTS distribution among course electives between 2, 4, 5, 6, 8 and 10 ECTS in the first term in the second year at the mobility institution (including CEU PU), which also provides flexibility to students to be able to devise a programme of in total 30 ECTS. The fourth term consists of the compulsory MA Thesis Module (30 ECTS) that includes MA thesis preparation, submission and defense. For students with CEU PU as either home or mobility university in the final term this comprises of 8 ECTS for a thesis writing workshop and 22 ECTS for Master's thesis preparation, submission and defense.

To fulfill all requirements for the MA Degree, students must earn 120 ECTS over four consecutive Terms and: 1. Achieve a passing grade (C+ or above) for all graded courses (90 ECTS) 2. Achieve a passing grade (C+ or above) for the Master's Thesis (30 ECTS); 3. Achieve a total Grade Point Average (GPA) of at least 2.66, equivalent to B-.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (GEMMA)

h. The students' workload required for the degree programme is devised in a way so as to allow them to reach the intended qualification objectives in the study period specified. The organisation of the degree programme and the students' workload of a part-time degree programme can be reconciled with a regular job.

The programme covers two years of study including compulsory modules as a foundation for the intended qualification, and course electives that allow for specialisation in the student's field of interest that complies with the interdisciplinary scope of the qualification. Finally there is ample time for the required qualification of a master thesis (20,000 to 30,000 words) within a complete term (30 ECTS) allocated to research, study, writing and defence (with writing workshops and individual supervision). The mobility period is also organized in such a way (either 1 or 2 terms in the second year), which allows for sufficient preparation time, integration and adaptation, and in depth study time for the student during her/his mobility period in a second institution. The option for finishing the thesis and fourth term in either the

home or mobility institution also allows for maximal flexibility, also with regards to assessing workload next to making practical arrangements.

CEU PU does not plan to offer part-time degree programmes.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (GEMMA)

i. The Private University has adopted examination rules. The examination methods are suitable to assess whether the defined learning outcomes have been achieved.

CEU PU has adopted the following rules regarding assessment: "Assessment methods should be explained with the indication of the share of the overall grade for the course resulting from each assessment. Assessment methods should be focused on verifying the achievement of the stated learning outcomes. Both formative and summative types of assessment should be used. For the sake of transparency, it is recommended that no more than 10% of the grade be awarded for class participation. Clear grading criteria should be included for all types of assessment."

The GEMMA programme states examination methods for every course that comply with teaching methods and learning outcomes, such as assessment of active class participation, attendance, essays, take-home/sit-in/oral exams, reflection or reaction papers, proposals, presentations (individually/group), conferences, discussion leading, portfolios, interview transcription and analysis, etc. There is a variety in grading and assessment methods within each course, and percentages are distributed for the final grade for the CEU PU courses which map onto the variety of learning outcomes and teaching methods for each course. The examination methods and grading distribution is also communicated clearly to the students as they are detailed in the course outlines.

According to the programme the master thesis workshop (at CEU PU) is not assessed separately, but the master thesis (including oral defence) is evaluated in its totality by the thesis supervisor and the second reader according to the following scale: (A) Pass with High Honors (Distinction) (A-) Pass with High Honors (Distinction) (B+) Pass with Honors (Merit) (B), (B-), (B) Pass.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (GEMMA)

j. A "diploma supplement" that complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 2 to the University Student Records Decree (Universitäts-Studienevidenzverordnung) of the Federal Ministry of Science, Research and Economy will be issued.

GEMMA CEU PU provides a diploma supplement that follows the model developed by the European Commission, Council of Europe and UNESCO/CEPES. The purpose of the supplement is to provide sufficient independent data to improve the international transparency and fair

academic and professional recognition of qualifications (diplomas, degrees, certificates etc.). It is designed to provide a description of the nature, level, context, content and status of the studies that were pursued and successfully completed by the individual named on the original qualification to which this supplement is appended. It should be free from any value judgements, equivalence statements or suggestions about recognition. Information in all eight sections should be provided. Where information is not provided, an explanation should give the reason why. These sections include: Information identifying the holder of the qualification; Information identifying the qualification; Information on the level of the qualification; Information on the contents and results gained; Information on the function of the qualification; Additional information; Information on the Austrian higher education system; an appendix with individual grades per term.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (GEMMA)

k. Admission requirements and the admission procedure are clearly defined. In terms of the qualification level, admission requirements meet at least the provisions laid down in the University Act 2002, Federal Law Gazette I 2002/120 as amended.

As an Erasmus Mundus Master's Degree programme, GEMMA accepts students from any country, including candidates from third countries. Programme admission requirements include eligibility, educational background, prior educational achievements, and other criteria such as academic excellence, relevant experience in the field of gender and women's studies, and proven knowledge of one or more of the consortium languages, by selection of the GEMMA Steering Committee. Eligible students have a BA degree, preferably but not exclusively in the Social Sciences and Humanities, and the documents identical to the institution's admission requirements, together with the application form which is the same for the whole consortium.

These admission requirements comply with the Austrian admission requirements that admission to a master's degree programme is granted on the basis of the successful completion of an Austrian bachelor's degree programme, or a comparable post-secondary degree acknowledged being its equivalent Areas/Modules of study are laid down in curricula.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (GEMMA)

I. The private university provides the public with easily accessible information on the general conditions for student agreements which each student has to sign.

CEU PU will establish a website after the successful accreditation. On the website, CEU will publish general information about the conditions for students agreements (contracts).

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (GEMMA)

m. Adequate support structures are available for students seeking advice on scientific, specialist, study-related organisational, or sociopsychological matters.

Analogous to § 14 (3) c, the criterion is **fulfilled**. See above: (3) Degree programmes and teaching.

Degree programme and degree programme management (GEMMA)

n. If e-learning, blended learning and distance learning are part of the programme, suitable didactic, technical, organisational and financial preconditions have been created to ensure the achievement of the degree programme's qualification objectives.

E-learning, blended learning and distance learning are not presented as central teaching and learning devices to the programme, and are only included as supplementary teaching methods in a minority of the individual course outlines, such as Moodle, blog postings, portfolio, etc.

Students have access to all services and facilities offered at the home and mobility university provided to regular students.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (GEMMA)

p. The following additional criteria apply to the accreditation of joint degree programmes:

- *The partner institutions are recognised post-secondary educational institutions.*
- *The degree programme has been accredited, if so required, in accordance with the national laws and regulations applicable in the partner institutions' countries, or a parallel or joint accreditation procedure is underway.*
- *In a co-operation agreement the institutions involved have specified the following aspects as a minimum:*
 - *academic performance to be rendered by the students at the respective institutions;*
 - *admission and selection procedures;*
 - *determination of the applicable study and examination regulation(s);*
 - *automatic and full recognition of examinations and scientific papers produced at the institutions involved;*
 - *academic degree and specification of how and by whom academic degrees will be awarded;*
 - *organisational rules and administrative accountability.*

According to the Cooperation agreement for the granting of a double master's degree (second cycle degree) in women's and gender studies of 2017, the coordinating institution of the consortium is the University of Granada and the partner institutions are Alma Mater Studiorum, Universita di Bologna Italy; Central European University Budapest Hungary; University of Hull UK; University of Lodz Poland; University of Oviedo Spain; Utrecht

University – The Netherlands. All partners are in accordance with the national laws and regulations regarding the granting of academic degrees, hence are recognized as postsecondary institutions.

The GEMMA programme has also been accredited in the partner institutions for granting a double Master's degree (second cycle degree) in women's and gender studies since the cooperation agreement of 2009 until 2011/2012, and selected as an Erasmus Mundus Master's degree in 2011 signed in a cooperation agreement in 2015 for the running of five editions of the programme (from 2012/2013-2016/17); and has applied for another four editions as an Erasmus Plus Program from 2017.

According to an addendum (March 2019) to the cooperation agreement of 2017, the inclusion of CEU GmbH (Vienna) as an associated partner institution in the GEMMA consortium is formalized, and members of the consortium confirm they are willing to upgrade CEU GmbH from association to full partner once the latter is accredited as CEU PU in Austria. CEU PU Vienna is in the process of accreditation and recognition as a postsecondary granting institution.

The cooperation agreement of 2017 stipulates the following aspects relevant for the accreditation of joint degree programs:

- the academic degree to be awarded is two second cycle degrees according to the two programme country institutions chosen (home and mobility). Each of the two degrees is accompanied by a diploma supplement and an additional certificate. The titles and degrees awarded are stipulated in the cooperation agreement of 2017.
- Common standards of admission and selection are organized by the GEMMA steering committee which acts on the advice of a preliminary screening of applications, carried out at the coordinating institution according to strictly technical criteria of eligibility.
- The GEMMA steering committee also facilitates cross-institutional consideration in terms of comparability of standards and learning experience.
- The programme is subject to review by all universities in the consortium as part of their ongoing periodic review process; coordinated by the steering committee.
- Assessments taken at each institution are examined in accordance with the regulations for boards of examiners at the awarding institution. Partner universities mutually recognize all examinations successfully passed by students at another partner university. The responsibility for producing and issuing clear transcripts of grades and final degree certificates lies with the awarding institution.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

8.2 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 Abs 5: Organisation of the private university and its services

Organisation of the private university and its services: Academic staff (GEMMA)

g. The scientific and/or artistic staff has the necessary pertinent and didactic qualifications.

Course lecturers and coordinators in the GEMMA programme as a whole are specialists in the field of women's and gender studies and/or related disciplines with sound academic

credentials. Regarding CEU PU, many lecturers are internationally renown for their research in this field and CEU gender studies is a longstanding and well-known authority for its excellence in the field in Europe and internationally. 11 lecturers who are appointed full-time and teach the key courses are at professorial level at CEU (1 university professor, 4 professors, 2 associate professors, 4 assistant professors), which accounts not only for more than sufficient expertise and critical teaching mass, but also for the required level of didactic qualifications. Several have profiles in co-ordination of education, and director positions of education and /or research. One part-time Recurrent Visiting Associate Professor has expertise in and teaches courses that are highly relevant to the field of women's and gender studies (discourse analysis and popular culture).

This criterion is **fulfilled**.

Organisation of the private university and its services: Academic staff (GEMMA)

h. Scientific and/or artistic staff in permanent employment shall teach at least 50% of the classes. Staff in permanent employment shall mean those persons who have a contractual relationship with the private university that covers at least 50% of their working hours in salaried employment.

Fulltime employed CEU faculty will teach almost all courses so this criterion should be fulfilled in the long term. CEU has provided the first contracts which shall account for a sufficient number of teaching staff at the start, including three fulltime positions (1 Professor, 2 assistant professors) and one halftime position (University professor).

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Organisation of the private university and its services: Academic staff (GEMMA)

i. The scientific and/or artistic staff for each combination of bachelor and/or master degree programmes consists of at least one permanent employee who possesses the required pertinent qualifications to be appointed professor, as well as one full time equivalent allocated to a maximum of three persons with at least a doctoral degree or artistic credentials, without prejudice to the provisions of section 14 para. 5 subpara. h.

See above, four employees with the required pertinent qualifications to be appointed professor have been offered contracts at 3,5 FTE.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

8.3 Summary and final assessment

GEMMA is a model programme of excellence and international co-operation in education in the field of women's and gender studies, in Europe and globally. Since 2006 it has been consistently recognized and funded by the European Commission and in 2017 received the prestigious title of Erasmus Mundus Joint Master Degree. CEU is an important, strong and very prominent partner within the programme, next to being an institution internationally renowned for its research and educational expertise in women's and gender studies internationally. Regarding criteria for accreditation of the Master degree programme "Women's and Gender Studies" (GEMMA) of Central European University – Private University (Vienna), it meets the qualification framework of the European Higher Education Area in its requirements for a second cycle qualification. As an interdisciplinary master situated in the social sciences and humanities, the qualification of 'Master of Arts' applies, as does the conjoining of women's studies and gender studies, hence the name of the degree programme corresponds to the qualification profile. The contents, structure and scope of the curriculum and the modules of the GEMMA programme meet the scientific and professional requirements. The teaching methods are also suited to achieve the intended learning outcomes of the programme, such as acquiring understandings, competences and skills in knowledge, theories, methods, and the applications of these in the field of interdisciplinary women's and gender studies. The programme takes into account diversity among students, seeing its objectives (a strong commitment to the analysis and the struggle against inequalities and injustices on the basis of differences) and alignment with the mission and strategic goals of CEU PU that include a strong opposition to all forms of discrimination. The academic degree is comparable on an international scale and application of the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS) is fully adequate and plausible. Workload and examination rules and methods are aligned with learning outcomes. Admission requirements and the admission procedure are clearly defined and the programme issues a compliant diploma supplement. Finally, the scientific staff has the necessary pertinent and didactic qualifications and there are sufficient appointments at the required level to guarantee teaching capacity.

In sum, the programme meets all the criteria necessary for accreditation of the Master degree programme "Women's and Gender Studies" (GEMMA) of Central European University – Private University (Vienna). It is recommended that the programme receives accreditation.

The programme could nevertheless perhaps benefit from reflection on the following issues and recommendations:

The programme could benefit from a more clearly defined teaching methodology and philosophy; an exercise in constructive alignment between programme learning outcomes and individual module and course learning outcomes, and a matrix aligning objectives, methods and examination methods. For example, it is recommended to update the general learning outcomes with regards to communication skills, which are present in individual modules and courses. The programme could also benefit from clearer positions on the relationship and emphasis on 'women' versus 'gender' studies (there are imbalances between institutions) and their relation to other fields such as men's studies, trans studies, dynamics of ethnicity, race and migration, etc. It would also be interesting to know how the programme sees itself in relation to some of its main objectives in terms of being more research or job market oriented: how are more professional qualifications for work in the field of gender equality

achieved/reflected in the programme? Finally, it would be interesting to know how the programme is experienced by mobile students and now also staff, and what limitations and opportunities this might have to offer.

8.4 Documents reviewed

- CEU PU Accreditation application April 2019

8.5 Confirmation of the expert

REMOVED FOR PUBLISHING

9 Annex 2: review report to MESPOM

9.1 Preliminary remarks by the experts

MESPOM is a two-years Erasmus Mundus Joint Master in Environmental Sciences, Policy and Management operated together with the University of Lund and the University of the Aegean. The multi-disciplinary study programme has been based on the idea that science, policy and management should be taught as three distinct but interacting knowledge and practice domains, which are necessary and essential to tackle any environmental issue. MESPOM has been selected three times in row as Erasmus Mundus Master, which awards EU-funded scholarships to the best student candidates applying under annual selection rounds to participate in the prestigious, integrated, international study programme.

9.2 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 17 (1) a-p: Degree programme and degree programme management – Erasmus Mundus Master of Arts in "Public Policy" (Mundus MAPP)

Degree programme and degree programme management (MESPOM)
<i>a. The degree programme is aligned with the objectives of the institution and is logically connected with the plan for its development.</i>

CEU PU "aims to be an international research-intensive university, committed to academic excellence and offering a transformative education with a global impact. [...] The academic and social dimensions of CEU's mission are closely intertwined. CEU PU seeks to produce research that transforms our understanding of the world and to produce scholars and professionals, citizens and public leaders who will serve the cause of knowledge-based economic and social development, justice, freedom and tolerance, the values upon which open societies depend" (Mission, CEU PU Accreditation Application).

The multi-disciplinary and international joint master programme MESPOM relates to several CEU PU's objectives and is clearly connected with its development plan. It offers transformative education to individuals aspiring to work on some of the most pressing environmental problems of today's societies. It fosters intellectual capacities for rethinking traditional framing of environmental challenges and respect for rigorous scientific knowledge in understanding these challenges. It promotes inter-disciplinary and inter-cultural dialogue concerning causes of and solutions to environmental problems.

The criterion is classified as **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MESPOM)

b. The qualification objectives of the degree programme (learning outcomes of the degree programme) have been clearly defined and meet the scientific and professional requirements and are in accordance with the respective levels of the qualification framework of the European Higher Education Area.

The application lists the learning outcomes as abilities of successful MESPOM graduate, e.g., thoroughly understand key facts and core concepts and approaches in environmental sciences, policy and management and their relationship to each other or analyse and critically evaluate management and policy practice in a range of environmental fields. The learning outcomes have been clearly defined and meet the scientific and professional requirements and are in accordance with the Master level of the qualification framework of the European Higher Education Area (Bologna Working Group. 2005), such as being able to apply knowledge and problem-solving abilities in new contexts or have the ability to integrate knowledge and handle complexity.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MESPOM)

c. The name of the degree programme corresponds to the qualification profile.

The “Masters in Environmental Sciences, Policy and Management” (MESPOM) has been based on the idea that science, policy and management should be taught as three distinct but interacting knowledge and practice domains, which are necessary and essential to tackle environmental issues. This founding idea is still reflected in the qualification profile, which corresponds to the name of the degree programme.

The criterion is classified as **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MESPOM)

d. The students are involved in an appropriate manner in shaping the teaching and learning processes. They are encouraged to be actively involved in the learning process.

MESPOM’s strategic focus on excellence in teaching and learning is mirrored in a very interactive curriculum including for example laboratory, field and practical components, internship, individual research papers, intense direct interaction with companies and municipalities and a students’ conference on transition, where they can explore their interests and hone their research and presentation skills under one-on-one guidance of CEU PU faculty. MESPOM promotes an interactive and engaging approach to teaching and learning. Students have to prepare for and play an active role in every class. Students are not perceived as passive recipients of the professors’ wisdom, but are strongly encouraged to actively participate in shaping their learning process.

The criterion is classified as **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MESPOM)

e. The contents, structure and scope of and the teaching method applied to the curriculum and the modules meet the scientific and professional requirements and are suited to achieve the intended learning outcomes. They furthermore take into account the requirements of a diversified student body.

The curriculum implemented in Vienna, Lund and on an Aegean island is well-structured and focused on the multi-disciplinary knowledge, skills and expertise needed to address environmental issues and contribute to a sustainability transition. The learning outcomes on transformative skills correspond with the didactic concept focusing on transformative skills and interactive learning methods. The latter include laboratory, field and practical components, internships, individual research papers, intense direct interaction with companies and municipalities and a students' conference on environmental crisis and transition, where students can explore their interests and hone their research and presentation skills under one-on-one guidance of faculty. Students of diverse geographical and disciplinary backgrounds are actively involved into their learning process. The joint master degree meets the scientific and professional requirements, as it builds the transformative, multi-disciplinary and inter-cultural expertise, skills and knowledge lined out in the mission statement and the learning outcomes

The criterion is classified as **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MESPOM)

f. The academic degree to be awarded is comparable on an international scale.

The academic degree of "Master of Science (MSc) in Environmental Sciences, Policy and Management" is awarded by one of the three partner universities. The degree corresponds to the programme title, the curriculum and is comparable to similar study programs on the international scale (e.g., various MSc programs in Environmental Sciences, Environmental Management and/or Environmental Policy). The outstanding feature of MESPOM is the combination of sciences, policy and management, which other master programs often address separately.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MESPOM)

g. The application of the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS) is adequate and plausible.

MESPOM corresponds to a total of 120 credit points, 20 each of the 3 terms in year one and 30 each of the two longer terms in year two. The master programme of 120 ECTS is on the upper end of the masters' qualification framework of the European Higher Education Area (Bologna Working Group. 2005). The workload of 30 hours per ECTS (CEU PU Accreditation application) corresponds to the EU workload ranges from 1,500 to 1,800 hours for an academic year (25 to 30 hours of work) (European Union 2015). The overall workload is

ambitious and at the upper range of the European Credit Transfer System. It seems adequate and plausible for the study programme as outlined in the curriculum and the syllabi of the individual courses.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MESPOM)

h. The students' workload required for the degree programme is devised in a way so as to allow them to reach the intended qualification objectives in the study period specified. The organisation of the degree programme and the students' workload of a part-time degree programme can be reconciled with a regular job.

The students' workload of 3,600 hours is high, however wisely allocated over the 5 terms/2 study years to be manageable (e.g., half a year or 30 ECTS for the master thesis).

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MESPOM)

i. The Private University has adopted examination rules. The examination methods are suitable to assess whether the defined learning outcomes have been achieved.

The MESPOM graduation requirement clearly lines out how students can successfully complete the taught component of the course (minimum 90 ECTS/45 CEU PU credits with GPA over 2.33; C+ /or above 50%) and the thesis project (C+/50-54% or higher). The clear grading scheme and criteria as defined in the individual course syllabi support a successful learning outcome assessment.

The criterion is classified as **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MESPOM)

j. A "diploma supplement" that complies with the requirements laid down in Annex 2 to the University Student Records Decree (Universitäts-Studienevidenzverordnung) of the Federal Ministry of Science, Research and Economy will be issued.

The diploma supplement follows the model developed by the European Commission, Council of Europe and UNESCO/CEPES. It provides a description of the nature, level, context, content and status of the study programme and the requirements for its successful completion. The CEU PU Student Records Office at the Dean of Students will be responsible for the preparation of diplomas and diploma supplements (CEU PU Accreditation application). The diploma supplement is in line with Annex 2 of the Austrian Universitäts-Studienevidenz-verordnung.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MESPOM)

k. Admission requirements and the admission procedure are clearly defined. In terms of the qualification level, admission requirements meet at least the provisions laid down in the University Act 2002, Federal Law Gazette I 2002/120 as amended.

The admission requirements and the admission procedure are clearly defined. Eligible applicants must have earned a first degree (Bachelor's or equivalent in environmental studies or closely related fields; not less than 3 years of full-time studies) from a recognized university or institution of higher education. They must demonstrate proficiency in English, academic and intellectual excellence, career promise including previous work or voluntary experience in the field of the environment; contribution to course diversity including previous international experience and background. The admission requirements not only meet the provisions laid down in the University Act 2002, but go far beyond it.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MESPOM)

I. The private university provides the public with easily accessible information on the general conditions for student agreements which each student has to sign.

During the site visit CEU PU convincingly conveyed its intention to publish all legally required documents on the university's website (see also § 14 (9)).

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MESPOM)

m. Adequate support structures are available for students seeking advice on scientific, specialist, study-related organisational, or sociopsychological matters.

Analogous to § 14 (3) c, the criterion is **fulfilled**. See above: (3) Degree programmes and teaching.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MESPOM)

n. If e-learning, blended learning and distance learning are part of the programme, suitable didactic, technical, organisational and financial preconditions have been created to ensure the achievement of the degree programme's qualification objectives.

According to the application documents, there is no need for suitable didactic, technical, organisational and financial preconditions for e-learning, blended learning and distance

learning, as all teaching takes place at one of the three universities, in the field or during internships.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

Degree programme and degree programme management (MESPOM)

p. The following additional criteria apply to the accreditation of joint degree programmes:

- *The partner institutions are recognised post-secondary educational institutions.*
- *The degree programme has been accredited, if so required, in accordance with the national laws and regulations applicable in the partner institutions' countries, or a parallel or joint accreditation procedure is underway.*
- *In a co-operation agreement the institutions involved have specified the following aspects as a minimum:*
 - *academic performance to be rendered by the students at the respective institutions;*
 - *admission and selection procedures;*
 - *determination of the applicable study and examination regulation(s);*
 - *automatic and full recognition of examinations and scientific papers produced at the institutions involved;*
 - *academic degree and specification of how and by whom academic degrees will be awarded;*
 - *organisational rules and administrative accountability.*

In 2005, MESPOM was created and selected as an Erasmus Mundus Masters course and operated within the Erasmus Mundus programme with four European partners until 2011. In 2009, MESPOM was selected as an EMMC for the 2nd time and operated under the Erasmus Mundus programme and then its successor Erasmus + programme from 2010 to 2016. Two North American partners joined the MESPOM Consortium in this period. In 2015-2019 MESPOM has been operating as a joint Master course without support from the European Commission. In 2017, MESPOM was selected as an Erasmus Mundus Joint Masters Degree to operate within the Erasmus+ programme from 2018 to 2022. Documents required for eligible Erasmus Mundus Master applications include accreditation procedures and a consortium agreement, covering admission and selection procedures, examination regulations as well as degree awarding, organisational and accountability rules. The partner institutions (University Lund, University of the Aegean) are internationally recognized post-secondary educational institutions.

The criterion is **fulfilled** as soon as signed co-operation agreements between CEU PU, Lund University and the University of the Aegean are provided.

9.3 Assessment criteria pursuant to § 14 Abs 5: Organisation of the private university and its services

Organisation of the private university and its services: Academic staff (MESPOM)

g. The scientific and/or artistic staff has the necessary pertinent and didactic qualifications.

Professor Aleh Cherp, Programme Director, is an internationally acknowledged environmental scientist, whose reputation is backed up by his publication records, but also by his activity as Panel Chair of the European Research Council or his Coordinating Lead Authorship of the Global Energy Assessment. The CEU PU faculty provides a diverse and multi-disciplinary teaching team of highly qualified social and natural scientists holding PhDs from top European, US and Canadian universities.

The CEU PU faculty is complemented with acknowledged teachers at Lund University and the University of the Aegean. Thus, the students have access to several top scholars in the field of environmental sciences, management and policy, who provide northern, southern and central European perspectives on environmental issues.

The criterion is classified as **fulfilled**.

Organisation of the private university and its services: Academic staff (MESPOM)

h. Scientific and/or artistic staff in permanent employment shall teach at least 50% of the classes. Staff in permanent employment shall mean those persons who have a contractual relationship with the private university that covers at least 50% of their working hours in salaried employment.

100% of the 12 MESPOM faculty members listed in the CEU PU faculty excel file are fully employed. At least one of them is involved in teaching any of the 42 courses. This exceeds by far the minimum requirement of 50% of classes taught by staff with a min. of 50% employment contract.

The criterion is classified as **fulfilled**.

Organisation of the private university and its services: Academic staff (MESPOM)

i. The scientific and/or artistic staff for each combination of bachelor and/or master degree programmes consists of at least one permanent employee who possesses the required pertinent qualifications to be appointed professor, as well as one full time equivalent allocated to a maximum of three persons with at least a doctoral degree or artistic credentials, without prejudice to the provisions of section 14 para. 5 subpara. h.

Ten of the twelve MESPOM faculty members are professors or associate professors, all of them have a PhD. This exceeds by far the minimum requirement of having at least one full-time employee with qualification to be appointed professor, and one additional full time equivalent allocated to a maximum of three persons with at least a doctoral degree.

The criterion is **fulfilled**.

9.4 Summary and final assessment

MESPOM is a joint Masters course in Environmental Sciences, Policy and Management operated by three internationally acknowledged European Universities. MESPOM prepares students for identifying and implementing solutions to complex environmental challenges. The two-year programme is delivered in English and comprises courses covering for example key environmental challenges or land, water and ecosystems management as well as an internship. It prepares students to pursue careers in tackling a wide variety of environmental challenges that require scientific analysis, policy design and evaluation, and management competences. The didactic conception fostering intellectual capacities for rethinking traditional framing of environmental challenges and respect for rigorous scientific knowledge underlines the high scientific and societal relevance of this outstanding programme, which ranges among the top environmental science, policy and management master programmes worldwide.

9.5 Documents reviewed

Documents provided by CEU PU

- CEU PU Accreditation application Apr2019
- Notary_Erklärung über die Errichtung der Gesellschaft
- Master of Science in Environmental Sciences, Policy and Management (MESPOM)
- Faculty CEU PU Vienna (xlcx)
- CVs (Aistara, Anthony, Antypas, Cherp, Illes, LaBelle, Mnatsakanian, Pinter, Steger, Urge-Vrosatz, Watt)
- Revised syllabi of 42 MESPOM courses
- Preliminary work contracts (Aleh Cherp, Guntra Anda Aistara, Laszlo Pinter, Amara Steger)
- Diploma Supplement MESPOM

Additional documents (not provided by CEU PU)

- Annex 2 to the University Student Records Decree (Universitäts-Studienevidenzverordnung) of the Federal Ministry of Science, Research and Economy

- Bologna Working Group. (2005) A Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area. Bologna Working Group Report on Qualifications Frameworks (Copenhagen, Danish Ministry of Science, Technology and Innovation).
- European Union (2015): ECTS Users' Guide - European Commission - Europa EU: https://ec.europa.eu/education/ects/users-guide/docs/ects-users-guide_en.pdf (downloaded on 24 May 2019)
- MESPOM – website: <http://mespom.eu/> (downloaded on 24 May 2019)
- Privatuniversitäten-Akkreditierungsverordnung 2019

9.6 Confirmation of the expert

REMOVED FOR PUBLISHING